Éditrice en chef / Editor in Chief
Tahmina Reza

Rédactrice en chef adjointe / Associate Editor
Fatiha Zemmou

Éditeurs consultatifs / Advisory Editors
Joerg Esleben, Rebecca Margolis, Agatha Schwartz, May Telmissany

Éditeurs conseillers / Consulting Editors
Amelia Baxter, Nicolas Bilodeau, William Felepchuk, Julie Mongeon

Conception et mise en page / Layout
Julie Mongeon

Remerciements spéciaux / Special thanks to:
Aida Beyrouti, Justine Draus, William Felepchuk
pour leur participation à la réalisation de ce volume /
for their work towards producing this volume.
SOMMAIRE/SUMMARY

DIASPORA:

Reinforcing Stereotypes through Bolivian Dance in Canada: The Unwittingly Negative Side of a Cultural Diaspora
By AMELIA BAXTER.................................................................8

Formation de la conscience diasporique – Cas d'étude: la vie et la peinture de William Kurelek
Par FATIHA ZEMMOU.............................................................22

A Curious Discovery: The Greek Diaspora in Ottawa
By AIDA BEYROUTI.................................................................41

L’AUTRE / THE OTHER:

Can Intolerance Inspire Economics? How Marketers Manipulate Multiculturalism to Sell Real Estate
By TAHMINA REZA.................................................................56

Découverte de l’étranger en nous-mêmes – Tension entre l’Être masculin et l’Autre féminin dans, L’enfant de sable, de Tahar Ben Jelloun
Par JULIE MONGEON.............................................................94

Kapuściński’s Representation of the Other: A Complex Dialogue between Theory and Practice
By JUSTINE DRAUS...............................................................113
C’est un grand plaisir d’introduire ce numéro inaugural de *Confetti* et de fêter ses contributrices, toutes des étudiantes dans le programme de Maîtrise ès arts en littératures et cultures du monde au Département des langues et littératures modernes à l’Université d’Ottawa. Of course, celebration and confetti go together just fine as is, but the journal’s title is significant beyond this immediate occasion. In its evocation of both multicoloured, joyful diversity and a carnivalesque spirit of criticism, the name captures part of the essence of the program the journal arises from.

La Maîtrise est un programme d’études interdisciplinaire et bilingue en sciences humaines qui offre une formation centrée sur la recherche et l’évaluation des formes de contacts, de relations et d’échanges multiculturels, interculturels et transculturels. The students in the program and the faculty members involved with it come from a broad range of academic disciplines and cultural backgrounds. Our shared passion for studying cultural expressions from around the world complements our immense diversity of approaches, and this combination leads to exciting and often unexpected synergies. Dans l’atmosphère intime de nos séminaires, nous apprenons les uns des autres et nous nous posons des défis intellectuels. In one short year, the faculty and student members of the program get to know and collaborate with each other in the development of the students’ individual research programs, and some of the fruits of that labour are presented here.
Mes collègues et moi sommes très, très fières/fiers des éditrices et auteures de *Confetti* et je tiens à les féliciter pour cette excellente initiative.

Joerg Esleben
Directeur du département, langues et littératures modernes
Department Chair, Modern Languages and Literatures

Ceci est un travail des étudiant(e)s de la Maîtrise ès arts en littératures et cultures du monde, un programme unique au Canada et au monde : bilingue, interdisciplinaire et dynamique. It is my honour and great pleasure as the director of this program to make a few introductory remarks to this exciting volume, created entirely by our students, which brings together works that encompass different methodologies, from textual to film analysis.

Ce volume comprend deux thèmes qui sont intégrales au programme : la diaspora et l’Autre. The first offers a look at diaspora in Canada: represented through performative dance, a system of cultural reference and a consciousness developed through visual art. Aida Beyrouti’s study examines the integration of the Greek community in Ottawa based on filmed interviews. Amelia Baxter offers an auto-ethnographic account of the author’s experiences in a Bolivian folkloric dance group in Montreal and posits them as “third existence dances.” Fatiha Zemmou propose une définition du concept diaspora basée sur l’idée de la conscience comme élément déclencheur d’un état d’esprit diasporique en analysant le peintre Canadien d’origine Ukrainienne, William Kurelek. The second section explores the idea of the Other in various incarnations. Tahmina Reza discusses ways in which Canadian real estate marketing employs attitudes towards the Other. Julie Mongeon pose la question : “que se produit-il
lorsque l’on découvre que l’Autre est non seulement à l’extérieur de notre personne mais est simultanément en nous-mêmes?” dans le roman L’enfant de sable, de Tahar Ben Jelloun. Justine Draus examine les techniques utilisées par le journaliste de voyage polonais Ryszard Kapuściński pour parler de l’Autre.

En somme, on trouve ici une collection variée et riche, un produit d’un groupe dédié. Au nom de tous les professeurs dans ce programme, je voudrais féliciter le groupe pour ce merveilleux projet.

Rebecca Margolis
Directrice, Maîtrise ès arts en littératures et cultures du monde
Director, Master of Arts in World Literatures and Cultures
DIASPORA

Un regard sur la diaspora au Canada: représenté par la danse performative, un système de référence culturelle et une conscience développée à travers l'art visuel.

A look at diaspora in Canada: represented through performative dance, a system of cultural reference, and a consciousness developed through visual art.
Reinforcing Stereotypes through Bolivian Dance in Canada: The Unwittingly Negative Side of a Cultural Diaspora

By AMELIA BAXTER

RéSUMÉ: Cet article utilise un point de vue auto-ethnographique des expériences vécues par l’auteure dans un groupe de danse bolivienne à Montréal. La danse est un élément essentiel de la diaspora bolivienne, ce qui permet aux boliviens de recréer une partie de leur patrie dans le pays d’hôte. Par contre, des faux stéréotypes, par exemple étiqueter les danseurs comme indigènes, sont trompeurs et prêtent à confusion. Les rôles de genre et les costumes occidentalisés, sont aussi analysés. Les boliviens transmettent un stéréotype simpliste au public canadien par le moyen d’appropriation culturelle. En utilisant la théorie de danse de seconde existence, les danses au Canada devraient être décrites comme des danses de troisième existence. Ce travail montre que les danses boliviennes sont présentées avec un public spécifique en tête, au lieu de leur but original.

MOTS-CÉLÉS: Bolivia, diaspora, la danse folklorique traditionnelle, Canada, la théorie de la danse de seconde existence

ABSTRACT: This article uses an auto-ethnographic account of the author’s experiences in a Bolivian folkloric dance group in Montreal. Dance is a crucial element of the Bolivian diaspora, which enables Bolivians to recreate part of their homeland in the hostland. However, false stereotypes such as labelling the dancers indigenous can be misleading. Gender roles and costumes, which are Westernized, are also discussed. Through cultural appropriation, Bolivians transmit a simplistic stereotype to a Canadian audience. By using second existence dance theory, it can be then demonstrated that these dances in Canada should be described as third existence dances. This article shows that Bolivian dances are presented with a specific public in mind, instead of their original purpose.

KEY WORDS: Bolivia, diaspora, traditional folkloric dance, Canada, second existence dance theory
The term “diaspora” originated with the need to describe the particular fate of the Jewish people. In the last two decades, it has expanded to include any group that has been dispersed from their homeland or point of origin (OED). In this way, the Greek etymology is embraced and includes all nationalities. Currently trending in the academic world, some scholars question its necessity, saying a more appropriate or better defined term ought to be used. One of the issues in diaspora studies is perception. Some self-identify as belonging to a marginalized group of people, whereas others have accepted full integration. Is the term still applicable if formed by a scholar? Does this lessen the feeling of being marginalized? People who are part of a diaspora can certainly be defined as outsiders in their hostland. Perhaps this phenomenon simply exemplifies the human desire to fit every group into neat boxes. Instead of people merely immigrating, they can now be called a diaspora. Some are struggling to propose an appropriate definition of a diaspora; whereas, others, perhaps to make it easier for everyone, are using the adjective “diasporic.” Using the adjective frees one of the necessity of qualifying for all of the noun’s attributes. When one migrates, one takes the stereotypes of one’s appearance and culture with them. This, in turn, becomes the representation of one’s homeland. In this manner, one becomes a cultural ambassador of sorts of the homeland in the hostland, unwittingly or not.

Traditional folk dances are often seen as imperative to understanding a nation. However, they can also offer incorrect impressions. A problem occurs when the original dance or ritual is no longer the root of the performance. Bolivian folkloric dance originated within indigenous groups and as such, was not meant for an outsider’s perspective. By keeping this so-called tradition alive, Bolivians perpetuate the image of the exotic bestowed upon the dance. One could say that the Bolivian celebration of
multiculturalism in Canada would be seen as similar to the First Nations dance and indeed, Bolivians do participate in First Nations festivals. However, the Bolivians dancing in Canada are not indigenous and thus, a first step of cultural appropriation has already occurred. Despite gaining a sense of Bolivianness by participating in dance groups in Canada, Bolivians are exoticising their own culture and enhancing the indigenous stereotype bestowed on them by Canadians. In this way, the diasporic Bolivian community is carrying a negative connotation to the hostland society.

I will first give a personal account of my experience participating in a Bolivian folkloric dance group in Montreal, followed by my definition of a diaspora and how this applies. Then, I will use “second existence folk dance theory” to analyse Bolivian dance and dissect the core elements, such as the music, the costumes, the choreography, gender roles, as well as the purpose behind the performance. I will also exemplify the problem of Bolivians being grouped together under the labels of “Latino,” “Hispanic” or “South American,” which has led to a dearth of scholarly articles and imprecise information on the Bolivian community.

This analysis of Bolivian dance is based primarily on my experiences as part of the Nuevo Amanecer (New Sunrise) group in Montreal for four years (2000-2004) when I was aged nine to thirteen. The group was founded by a Bolivian born woman, Veronica Cho, who danced in Bolivia when she was younger. When she immigrated to Canada, she started a group as a duo with her female cousin for fun, despite a lack of men and more couples in general. The group then evolved to separated adult and children’s groups in Montreal. The students were taught by native-born Bolivian mothers, who would periodically return to Bolivia for inspiration and dance costumes. The choreography was then transmitted to their students, who were also their children. The majority of students were second generation Canadians. Only one girl was Canadian-born to Canadian parents.
who had lived in Bolivia for several years, seen the dance there and wished to partake in this culture in their Canadian homeland. The dancers’ ages ranged from four to forty-five. The others my age had danced since they were little, but were entering the pre-teen phase where some started to drift away from the group, being out of touch with Bolivian culture as this was the only time they were exposed to it. It is important to note that the second generation Canadians had not been to Bolivia prior to joining the group. Consequently, it was easy to lose the link to their heritage. However, traveling to Bolivia for the first time and seeing how popular the dance is in the homeland renewed their attraction for the practice and they returned with newfound ambition. Within the four-year period, I went to practices once or twice a week at the Bolivian Association in Montreal, depending on how close we were to performing. During the summer, we would practice in public parks, notably Jean-Talon, to take advantage of the space and to garner publicity. I participated in a variety of performances including annual Bolivian parties and Week-ends du monde in Montreal, as well as the Carnival of Cultures in Ottawa, the Mondial des Cultures festival at Drummondville, and choreographing Tobas for three of my (non-Bolivian) friends and I to participate in our high school’s annual talent show. There were around thirty participants in total, including the teachers who would occasionally dance. I was one of only three half-Bolivians, the others were born in Canada of two Bolivian born parents. Spanish was the main language spoken at home (except for me). The majority second language was French learned at school, with only one other girl speaking English comfortably. Classes were taught in Spanish, but we (the younger generation) would speak French amongst ourselves. Managing the entire group and all it entailed was based on a collaborative effort. Some of the costumes and alterations were sewn by the parents if they could not be brought from Bolivia. The dresses remained in the group’s possession. Aside
from a minimal inscription fee, the dancers did not invest any money into the group. Instead, fundraisers were held, for example selling Bolivian food. Dance festivals paid us to participate and so this money was cycled back into the group to pay for the costumes and transportation, etc.¹

The scholarly literature on Bolivians in Canada, let alone Bolivian dance in Canada, is slim if nonexistent. More studies have been conducted on Latinos in the United States, occasionally specifying Bolivians as the subject matter. Some attributes do parallel Canadian Bolivians, but in general, Bolivians in Canada are underrepresented. For this reason, I rely mainly on Eveline Sigl’s article on “Diasporic Identities” despite being a cyber-­anthropological study.² Culture and identity share close ties in such a way that when one is participating in a cultural activity, such as dance, one also highlights and defines the importance of this activity to a group’s identity.

To define diaspora, I will use five of William Safran’s six points: first, dispersed from an original centre to two or more regions; second, retaining a collective vision about the homeland; third, feeling insulated from the host society; fourth, committed to maintenance and prosperity of homeland; fifth, relating to the homeland (83). I excluded eventual return to homeland because Bolivians are generally more prosperous overseas in a first world country and tend not to move back to their country. Instead, one could say that a cultural return occurs, instead of a physical one. Bolivians participate in cultural activities in order to feel more at home. In addition to Safran’s points, I am adding Ghosh’s suggestion that a diaspora is based on “recreating culture in various locations, rather than a desire to return to a place” (qtd. in Batson 39). This statement is thought-provoking since instead of basing diaspora on a physical displacement, it is viewed as a cultural practice, again intersecting culture and identity.

¹ Of course, these experiences are only good insofar as my memory can recall.
² I translated all quotes from the article, originally written in Spanish.
I will now discuss these characteristics one by one and demonstrate how they relate to Bolivian folkloric dance. The majority of Bolivians have migrated to the United States of America, as the literature shows, yet nowadays, Bolivians can be found around the globe. It is important to note that the Bolivians who are able to migrate are of better economic standing. Dance first dispersed from the indigenous communities to the larger Bolivian population, who have then taken the dance outside of the country with them. Second, Bolivians certainly do retain a collective vision by showcasing traditional dances that has now also branched into a sense of solidarity. This solidarity is especially seen outside of the country when one is part of a minority group. Partaking in the characteristics of a certain group reaffirms one’s identity. Additionally, Bolivians in the host land feel a heightened sense of Bolivianness outside the homeland, which is often associated with dance (Sigl 195). Bolivians living in Bolivia live in the homeland culture and those in Canada transport this collective image outside the country. As such, it could be argued that Bolivian dance is not a true vision of Bolivia, yet everyone maintains it is. Third, the feeling of insulation from the homeland is what incites Bolivians to create a dance group in order to feel a sense of belonging amidst all the new. To enhance the feeling of insulation, South Americans are usually grouped together by region instead of nationality. The labels South American, Hispanic, and Latino denote such a wide variety of ethnicities with different traits that stereotypes become far too generalized. In this way, false stereotypes often prevail. As Sigl argues, forming part of a cultural group provides a social nucleus that aids Bolivians to orient themselves to their new life in the host land (195). The feeling of alienation is thus lessened. Fourth, participating in a Bolivian dance group certainly maintains the image that Canadians, in this case, have of the homeland. It is prosperous in the sense that the culture is disseminated in Canada, thus bringing more awareness about being Bolivian.
But can a people be judged by their culture especially when it could be said that dance is a cultural representation? Ostashewski posits that a danger exists when one looks only at the artistic elements of culture in order to define a people (66). The majority of Bolivians are indigenous, yet they are not so readily accepted into the cities despite the fact that Bolivia elected an indigenous president, Evo Morales, for the first time in 2006. The exodus towards a city culture has only occurred within the last two decades. Others, such as Canadians, may already expect a fanciful image one has of Bolivia, such as the one of the “docile aboriginal.” This perception is further enhanced by Bolivian dance groups participating at the First Nations festival in Montreal. Folkloric dance groups are seen as indigenous, yet give a false representation of their own communities. Fifth, I would go so far as to say that Bolivians relate more to the homeland outside Bolivia by being a part of a dance group to assert their Bolivianness. Being a Bolivian in Bolivia is simple in comparison to the multi-layered “where do you come from?” question in multicultural Canada. However, demonstrating one’s culture, which becomes one’s identity, is a sense of pride amongst immigrants. Sigl states that Bolivians feel more Bolivian outside the country, in addition to feeling the need to assert themselves in a new environment (195). Involvement and frequency of participation in cultural activities are irrelevant as long as members identify with the ethnicity and cultural symbols (Batson 40). Lastly, the term “recreating” is essential, meaning that the Bolivian dances are not merely transposed, but are reconfigured and recreated for a new environment and a different audience. The recreation begins in Bolivia itself, where the non-indigenous population partakes in dances that have become less of a traditional ritual and more for show. In this manner, the dance has already undergone a change in the homeland itself. By establishing the importance of Bolivian dance to its people in diaspora, we can further understand the impact on Canadian society.
To expand on the previous point on recreating dance, I will show how the Bolivian dance diaspora emanates within Bolivia itself. Based on Hoerburger’s theory on second existence folk dance, Nahachewsky posits that first existence folk dance is “chiefly an integral part of the life of a community” and is “learned in a natural, functional way. Everybody participated from the very beginning of his life.” As such, it can be considered as an “original tradition” (18). The first existence of Bolivian dance can be traced back to the Andean indigenous communities living in rural areas where dance is not seen as a performance but as a way of life, for example, in giving thanks for the crops. One could say that this practice would not be seen as dance, but instead as ritual and custom. It should also be mentioned that the origin of the dance is contested by Peru and Chile. Bolivia used to be a part of Peru until the Declaration of Independence on the 6th of August, 1825 and Bolivia ceded its territory to Chile in 1904. The ongoing territorial claim and border changes could have led to the lost or confused origins of certain dances. To further this issue, Sigl notes online comments on dance videos often pertaining to the origin of the dance, particularly several rude and insulting ones, each claiming possession according to the country. However, there are also some commenters who ask everyone to “get along since we are all Latinos” (204). Here, we see the umbrella term being applied by a native in an effort to stabilize relationships instead of repeating a territorial war.

In contrast, second existence folk dance is the property of “a few interested people,” has “fixed figures and movements,” “has to be taught to the dancers by special dance teachers or dance leaders,” and is a “conscious revival or cultivation of folk dance” (Nahachewsky 18). This type of folk dance is one that takes time and effort to learn; something one does deliberately. To recapitulate, Berger states a blurred line exists between performance and everyday life. In certain instances, each element is
separate, but in other instances performance can be used as a commentary on the mundane (15). Here; however, everyday life would be first existence and performance would be second existence dance. In this case, first existence is given a sense of normalcy while performance is denoted as something out of character. In Bolivian, second existence dance is already performed at schools and festivals. Bolivian dance is now a mandatory class for most school children, culminating in an end of year show. Additionally, there are many groups who compete amongst each other to be able to present at Bolivia’s main cultural export: the carnival of Oruro, a UNESCO-protected festival. Tourists from all over the world trek to Bolivia to watch the carnival: it is the largest and most popular representation of culture the country offers. Sigl incorporates class distinction into the discussion: dancing at certain events in Bolivia connotes a particular class, namely the elite white from rich residential areas. Also, being short and indigenous in Bolivia is a stigmatization (195). Ethnicity and power are brought into play here since the aboriginal communities cannot even showcase dances in their own country. Another important element is the dramatic costume changes. Not only are masks worn for certain dances like the Diablada, but girls wear far shorter skirts than the original indigenous dancers. The costume is, of course, part of the show and is used to attract more viewers and perhaps more participation. Additionally, miniskirts are associated with the West and serve to allow Westerners a better connection to the dancers (200). While reaffirming incorrect stereotypes, the dancer’s identity is positively affected because of the established link to the audience (202). In other words, the dance is seen as exotic but certain elements render it familiar and relatable to Canadian culture.

The costumes, in addition to the movements, create a certain gender dynamic where the women are seen as very feminine and sensual, whereas, the men are seen as virile, displaying manly movements, as in
Caporales with the women swishing their short skirts side to side in heels. Morenada is another dance showcasing women in short skirts with the men dress up in bear costumes. This is not to say that every dance boasts a gender gap. In Tinku, both men and women share the same steps and are seen in fake combat with each other, and so both genders are on the same level. In Tobas, both men and women share the same jumping step. Another problem is that the dance patterns are at the mercy of the dance teacher, who may choose to separate the men and women, pair them up, or showcase them as equals. These arrangements affect the whole spirit of the dance. One arranges a dance with a public in mind: the dancers are meant to be watched and display Bolivian culture in Bolivian attire.

If non-indigenous Bolivians dancing in Bolivia can be characterized as second existence folk dance, then I posit that dance groups formed outside Bolivia could be said to be third existence, being one more times removed from the origin, however disputed it may be. While creating a folkloric group can reaffirm the cultural identity of migrants and their descendants, it also establishes differences between indigenous and non-indigenous Bolivians. In Canada, a positive identity would be attached to participating in showcasing culture along with a certain level of respect in the Bolivian community. This is evidenced by high level of participation in the inordinate amount of cultural festivals in Canada. The Bolivian identity is elevated by dance and spectacle. The danger of second and third existence folk dances is that one can objectify and analyse what is understood to be life in the first existence (Ostasewski 92). All three existences claim to share the same characteristics, yet there is only one real existence: the first. The indigenous is thus seen as far more attractive, posing as a “sweet, inferior infant” (Wollrad qtd. in Sigl 199). While this affects dancers’ identities in a positive light, an orientalist view can be applied to the dances. They are being exoticised, confusing the pure and ethnic first existence folk dance with
performance. Original steps and movements are mixed with foreign figures, thus being indigenous is attributed to these dances, and therefore popular with Westerners. It is also valid to note that bringing dance costumes to the host land is not as difficult financially since those who can migrate are better off. All these elements contribute to the fact that there could never be first existence folk dance shown outside the indigenous communities because doing so would immediately characterize it as second existence. Additionally, Raymond Williams states that “all traditions are by their very nature selective” (qtd. in Guss 15). This is especially true in dance. The choreographer decides who, what, where, when, why, and how. Nothing is objective here, a specific intent exists to showcase certain elements and hide others.

Cultural performances are recognised as sites of social action where identities and relations are continually reconfigured (Guss 12). Bolivian identity is being changed by virtue of the dance and the spectator. Identity impacts the spectator’s perception or preconceived stereotype, which is projected onto the dance and the dancers. As embodiments of Bolivian culture, the dancers are all seen as the stereotypical or perhaps the ideal Bolivian. This train of thinking can be problematic since the perceived persona is simply part of the performance instead of reality. The issue for the spectator is differentiating between the performance and reality. Of course, a show is primarily entertainment and is meant to show all the best the country has to offer. Yet a performance is not necessarily the best place for truth telling, especially since the spectator seems to garner a lot of information about the culture, which is in fact erroneous. Since the dancers appear to be Bolivian, and even perhaps look indigenous, they are seen as presenting the correct image to the audience. By doing so, Bolivian dance groups enhance the false stereotype imposed on them by Canadians. It is difficult to say whether this is right or wrong since the primary reason
Bolivians join dance groups is to feel part of a community, to have a social interaction. Bringing the dance culture from the homeland only demonstrates how proud they are of their country, but also that Bolivians themselves are unaware of the image they are distorting.

Bolivian folkloric dance can be said to constitute a diaspora as well as a third existence reconstitution of rituals and traditions. By virtue of belonging to a dance group in Canada, denoting dispersion, there is already a sense of alienation in the host land, and the culture is maintained as is the relation to the homeland. The vision of the homeland can be seen in the dance itself and would perhaps be better called a myth in this case, due to false representation. Above all, recreating the culture in Bolivia by non-indigenous Bolivians, who then recreate the culture in Canada is certainly third existence folk dance.

I admit that this research is meant as a point of embarkment, perhaps better suited for an ethnographic research. The opinions of the indigenous groups are missing, in particular. Do they feel that their ritual dances have been reappropriated to form the image of an entire country to outsiders? Another question would be whether the cultural appropriation can be termed as such if both indigenous and non-indigenous citizens consider themselves Bolivian? Due to the current Bolivian president, as well as the widespread indigenous movement into the cities, the indigenous population of Bolivia has become more visible. Unlike First Nations in Canada, they do not live on reserves and have made steps forward towards urban integration. This type of analysis would most likely necessitate a Quechua or Aymara translator since Spanish is not as widespread in these communities. Additionally, participating and documenting the process of being part of the carnival of Oruro would be a good way to examine how Bolivians set up a show to be viewed in the public eye.
Another point of contention is whether this diaspora is generational or not. One of the characteristics of a diaspora is its intergenerational duration. In this case, the study can currently be carried out, but in the future it would be beneficial to discover if the second generation Canadians have passed on Bolivian dancing to their children. How long can the Bolivian dance diaspora last and what are the circumstances relating to its duration? Does marrying another ethnicity prohibit or lessen the practice of certain cultural traditions?

Another area of study is whether a dance can still be considered folk dance when it is performed. Folk dance is about keeping traditions alive, to be kept within the community. A performance is organised with the public in mind; one has to put on a show and make it appealing to watch. The problem with the dissemination of culture is finding its origin. Culture can be appropriated in a variety of ways and forms, changing meaning along the way. In this manner, it can be difficult to correctly say which part of culture belongs to which community. Just as Bolivians, Chileans, and Peruvians reclaim the same dances, Uruguayans and Argentines both claim possession of the tango. Established borders and migration make it difficult to discern who is correct, but does this really matter? One could say that it does because in order to properly reenact culture, one must understand the origin of its practice and the reasons behind it.

Perhaps we, wanting to see our country as inclusive, have become overly sensitive. If dancing in Canada brings a sense of pride to Bolivians, then why shouldn’t they be allowed to practice it? This is a deeply rooted practice in the culture in the homeland, whether right or wrong, so only government support would be able to change if Bolivians can continue to propagate their culture. Of course, the government supports the carnival and other tourist attractions, so one can surmise that Bolivian folkloric dance will continue to be a longstanding tradition for years to come.


Formation de la conscience diasporique – Cas d'étude: la vie et la peinture de William Kurelek

Par FATTIHA ZEMMOU

RÉSUMÉ : L'article propose une définition du concept diaspora basée sur l'idée de la conscience comme élément déclencheur d'un état d'esprit diasporique. Pour appuyer la validité de cette définition la présente étude se place dans le domaine des arts visuels en analysant, à la fois, un article écrit par le peintre Canadien d'origine Ukrainienne, William Kurelek, ainsi que ses œuvres artistiques. En effet, une personne peut développer une conscience diasporique à travers plusieurs étapes. Toutefois, l'exemple du peintre, prouve que la quête d'une conscience diasporique peut ne pas suivre le même cheminement de la définition proposée, mais en possède les mêmes éléments.

MOTS-CÉS: Diaspora, conscience, art visuel, peinture, William Kurelek, Canada/Ukraine, pays d'accueil, pays d'origine

ABSTRACT: This article offers a definition of the concept of diaspora based on the idea of consciousness as trigger for diasporic mindset. To support the validity of this definition, the present study is located in the visual arts and attempts to analyze an article written by William Kurelek, a Canadian painter of Ukrainian origin, and his artistic works. In fact, a person can develop a diasporic consciousness through several stages. However, Kurelek's case proves that the quest for a diasporic consciousness may not follow the same order of the proposed definition but it possesses the same elements.

KEY WORDS: Diaspora, consciousness, visual art, painting, William Kurelek, Canada / Ukraine, host land, home land
Le concept de diaspora, comme n’importe quel concept en sciences humaines, peut avoir une panoplie de définitions. Pour cette raison et afin de dédramatiser ce terme, nous allons nous baser sur son premier niveau de définition qui consiste à dédramatiser la nature du concept diaspora. En d’autres termes, il s’agit de déterminer s’il est un mouvement migratoire, un qualificatif d’une certaine communauté ou bien une conscience diasporique.

D’un côté, il y a certains spécialistes qui définissent la diaspora comme une forme particulière d’immigration ou le plus souvent qualifiée d’immigration involontaire; « diaspora tends to have greater explanatory power when applied to forms of involuntary migration rather than to migration in general » (Kenny 13). En effet, c’est une immigration qui est conditionnée par des circonstances diverses (politiques, historiques, sociologiques, économiques et religieuses) et plus ou moins catastrophiques. S’ajoute à cette conception, l’idée de séparation, car qui dit immigration, dit aussi séparation d’un pays d’origine et installation dans un pays d’accueil. Clifford, parmi d’autres, croit que le concept de diaspora est très associé à l’idée d’une séparation de longue distance similaire à celle de l’exil (304). Quant à Brubaker, il décrit ce mouvement migratoire comme une séparation d’une terre d’origine à des destinations multiples et variées qu’il nomme « dispersion in space » et qui représente, selon lui, le critère le plus accepté du concept de diaspora (5). Ce dernier point nous rappelle le modèle de la diaspora juive qui incarne par excellence l’idée de la dispersion dans l’espace.

En outre, la deuxième nature de la diaspora se réfère à une communauté particulière ayant des critères spécifiques. Safran était parmi les premiers à pouvoir définir la diaspora comme une communauté minoritaire expatriée qui répond à un certain nombre de caractéristiques. Il distingue entre six critères :
1) they, or their ancestors, have been dispersed from a specific original "center" to two or more "peripheral," or foreign, regions; 2) they retain a collective memory, vision, or myth about their original homeland—its physical location, history, and achievements; 3) they believe that they are not—and perhaps cannot be—fully accepted by their host society and therefore feel partly alienated and insulated from it; 4) they regard their ancestral homeland as their true, ideal home and as the place to which they or their descendants would (or should) eventually return—when conditions are appropriate; 5) they believe that they should, collectively, be committed to the maintenance or restoration of their original homeland and to its safety and prosperity; and 6) they continue to relate, personally or vicariously, to that homeland in one way or another, and their ethnocommunal consciousness and solidarity are importantly defined by the existence of such a relationship. (83)

La limitation avec cette définition, par contre, réside dans le fait qu'elle ressemble à une liste de contrôle. En fait, ce genre de définition prête à confusion, car il est difficile de calquer cette typologie à plus d'une communauté. Par exemple, est-il possible de qualifier une communauté comme diasporique dans le cas où elle possède que quatre critères sur six?

D'un autre côté, la troisième nature de la diaspora peut être considérée comme un sentiment de conscience par rapport à un contexte diasporique. Effectivement, Clifford distingue entre deux consciences diasporiques; l'une négative et l'autre positive. Cette typologie de la conscience diasporique est soumise aux circonstances de vie et d'intégration des communautés diasporiques. En fait, la conscience diasporique peut naître des situations négatives par exemple; de rejet, d'exclusion et des expériences de discrimination de la part de la société d'accueil envers une personne ou envers une communauté, voir une minorité (Clifford 311). Elle peut être constituée positivement en raison d'une solidarité entre les membres d'une communauté diasporique partageant une mémoire collective. Ce dernier point coïncide avec le sixième critère de la liste de
Safran lequel est illustré dans l’article de Clifford « Diasporas » par la communauté maghrébine ayant la même histoire coloniale (312).

Pour regrouper ces trois natures de la diaspora en une seule définition, nous proposons que ce soit d’abord une conscience construite par quatre éléments détaillés de la manière suivante :

1. Les circonstances ainsi que les causes de la séparation de certaines communautés de leur pays d’origine (le plus souvent c’est des conditions misérables de vie);
2. Les conditions d’intégration dans un pays d’accueil marquées par une certaine difficulté;
3. La volonté des communautés diasporiques de maintenir un lien entre eux au sein du pays d’accueil et avec le pays d’origine;
4. La relation intergénérationnelle de la diaspora entre acceptation et déni de leur condition diasporique.

La présente étude se fixe comme objectif d’étudier la validité de cette définition dans le domaine des arts visuels et plus précisément, en se basant sur un article écrit par William Kurelek et sur ses peintures. C’est un artiste canadien descendant d’une famille d’immigrants ukrainiens; sa vie et ses œuvres ont suscité beaucoup d’intérêt de la part des chercheurs dans presque tous les domaines des sciences humaines. En effet, en se basant sur sa vie et ses peintures nous allons analyser le processus de formation de sa conscience diasporique en tant que membre de la deuxième génération de la communauté ukrainienne au Canada et l’impact qu’a ce processus sur ses œuvres artistiques.

D’après son article intitulé « Development of Ethnic Consciousness in a Canadian Painter », Kurelek nous brosses les différentes étapes de sa quête de conscience diasporique, qu’il décrit comme une quête « circulaire »
(49), puisqu’elle commence et se termine par un seul point. Selon lui, c’est une conscience ethnique, mais en se référant à la conception de Clifford, sa quête ressemble plus à une conscience diasporique dans la mesure où, elle est née d’une exclusion, d’une auto-exclusion, d’une crise identitaire et d’une solidarité liée à une mémoire ukrainienne partagée. En effet, la conscience diasporique du peintre a commencé dès l’enfance, dans un contexte scolaire anglo-saxon. Il devient conscient qu’il fait partie d’une minorité culturelle, car la majorité ne partage pas sa langue ukrainienne. En fait, il raconte qu’à la vue d’une mouche, il crie « Mookha, Mookha! » d’une manière spontanée, puisqu’il est habitué à l’usage de la langue ukrainienne dans son milieu familial. Cependant, la classe non seulement ne comprend pas ce qu’il a dit, mais s’éclate de rire (Kurelek 46). C’est une prise de conscience qui est un peu difficile pour un enfant puisqu’elle a été accompagnée d’un embarras et d’un sentiment de minorité presque similaire à une exclusion. Dans une toile intitulée « One Room School at Kaszuby » ayant comme thématique globale l’enfance dans un contexte scolaire, il y a trois éléments essentiels à noter et qui ont une relation avec cette première prise de conscience. Il s’agit du drapeau anglais qui montre que c’est un milieu anglo-saxon. Ensuite, il indique la thématique de l’exclusion avec le groupe d’enfants qui jouent ensemble (en action) et la présence d’un seul enfant en écart d’eux (immobile). Finalement, il y a le cadre de la photo qui semble avoir une connotation culturelle ukrainienne. En fait, le cadre constitue la signature artistique de son œuvre, il a autant d’importance que le message et la peinture elle-même. Il s’avère que Kurelek utilise plusieurs styles d’encadrement parmi lesquels « la touche folklorique et le simple motif linéaire ukrainiens qui expriment la fierté » (Dedor 234).

Deuxième prise de conscience diasporique rentre toujours dans un contexte scolaire, cette fois-ci à l’école secondaire de Winnipeg. À cette époque, Kurelek commence à se poser des questions identitaires « whether I
was Ukrainian or English Canadian » (Kurelek 47). En d’autres termes, il commence à découvrir qu’il possède une double identité ukraino-canadienne, mais il n’arrive pas à trancher s’il est entièrement Ukrainien ou Canadien ou l’amalgame des deux. La réponse venait de son professeur Father Mayewsky qui était un nationaliste ukrainien. Kurelek admet qu’il était charmé par ce professeur et par l’histoire de l’Ukraine qu’il enseignait, à tel point qu’il idéalisait tout ce qui est ukrainien (le pays, les gens et la culture). De plus, Father Mayewsky prêtait une attention au don artistique de Kurelek contrairement à son père Dmytro qui maudissait ce côté de sa personne en le menaçant pour qu’il renonce à ses inclinations artistiques (47). Ce dernier point, celui de la place du père dans la vie de Kurelek, constitue l’influence la plus visible et importante dans son œuvre. Parmi les différentes toiles ayant pour thème la tyrannie paternelle, il y a une peinture intitulée « Behold Man Without God » sous forme de plusieurs scènes partageant le même cadre spatial. La figure paternelle y est représentée comme un despote; un homme possédant une langue sous forme de fouet pour frapper l’esclave (Kurelek) qui conduit sa charrette (Jo Hughes 200) et sous forme d’un homme qui inflige une punition corporelle à un enfant symbolisant Kurelek. Une autre peinture, « I Spit On Life » possède le même style séquentiel ressemblant à des bribes de souvenirs incrustés dans un de mur. Nous retrouvons dans ce tableau d’une part, la même figure paternelle avec une langue de serpent dominant la famille lors d’un repas. D’autre part, il y a deux figures parentales qui essaient d’enfermer un enfant vivant (Kurelek) dans un cercueil.

En outre, une fois à l’Université, Kurelek commence à se douter de ses croyances religieuses et même de sa culture ukrainienne. Il affirme qu’à cette époque il découvre et éprouve un intérêt pour des livres athées, ce qui a suscité un doute et un mépris, chez lui, vis-à-vis de l’influence religieuse et ukrainienne de Father Mayewsky. Il dit :
Having lost respect for the official religion on which [Father Mayewsky] was a representative, i [...] had to avoid him. Secondly, it meant rebellion against family loyalties (and the family was Ukrainian) and turning instead toward self-discovery. (48)

D’une part, la rébellion contre sa famille voulait dire aussi la poursuite de son rêve, celui de devenir un peintre, malgré les menaces et dissuasions de son père. L’œuvre intitulée « Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man » incarne cette volonté

   de prouver sa véritable identité en tant qu’artiste : “ je pensais pouvoir y parvenir par quatre éléments : en rendant bien (1) l’aspect du pain, (2) des mains vivantes, (3) le matériel de la chemise, (4) et la reproduction fidèle des traits de mon visage” ». (Jo Hughes 196)

Sa révolution est illustrée dans cette peinture par la nudité, surtout une scène où une silhouette danse en plein nature à la lumière de la lune.

D’autre part, il a évoqué son désir de se lancer dans une autodécouverte qui va être un déclencheur pénible mais efficace dans sa quête pour une conscience diasporique. En effet, il s’agit de sa crise identitaire qui a mené à son séjour psychiatrique à Londres en 1952, durant cette période Kurelek affirme que sa conscience comme artiste ethnique meurt avec cette crise « [...] I was finished [...] as a Canadian, a Ukrainian, an artist or even just a human being » (49). La toile qui montre par excellence son état psychologique à cette époque s’intitule « The Maze », dans lequel il peint d’une manière très détaillée son état mental. Parmi ces détails, il y a une image qui montre Kurelek mis dehors, dans le froid glacial, par son père d’une manière agressive et cruelle. S’ajoute à cette idée, une autre image d’un enfant (Kurelek) coincé entre deux figures qui représentent son père; l’une souriante avec un regard affectueux et l’autre maussade qui donne presque une impression de dégout vis-à-vis de cet enfant. Cette image
particulière possède un symbolisme très fort par rapport à l’ambiguïté et la confusion pathologique de Kurelek face à son identification paternelle. Ce sentiment de dichotomie est présent dans une image qui représente des familles qui protestent contre la guerre avec des affiches qui disent « War is Peace ». Kurelek affirmait dans son autobiographie qu’il voulait dévoiler son sentiment « de persécution, d’apitoiement sur soi et d’amertume, issu de sa relation avec son père […] de même que de son malaise général avec la “société normale” » (Jo Hughes 199). Jo Hughes explique ce tableau comme « un autoportrait macabre » de sa maladie mentale. En fait, selon Jo Hughes c’est « un labyrinthe “sans sortie” dans lequel un rat (symbolisant l’artiste lui-même), incapable de s’en échapper, était mort » (199). Il est à noter que durant cette période de traitement psychiatrique, Kurelek a produit plusieurs tableaux montrant l’évolution de son état mental ayant pour thème la quête de son identité perdue. Il s’agit de trois tableaux qui montrent sa prise de conscience religieuse. La première œuvre est intitulée « Pre-Maze », dans laquelle un personnage symbolisant Kurelek est enfermé à huis clos privé de ses sens (la vision, l’ouï et la parole) en train de chercher un issu pour sortir. En fait, le peintre met en évidence ce processus de recherche en mettant l’accent sur la représentation des mains. Dans le deuxième tableau « Where Am I? Who Am I? Why Am I? », il existe toujours ce jeu de mains qui symbolise la quête de la personne représentant Kurelek. Effectivement, il semblerait que ce personnage aveugle a trouvé une sortie même si c’est dans un monde sombre et stérile. Le troisième tableau « Lord That I May See » nous rappelle dès son titre qu’il y a une connotation religieuse. En effet, c’est dans la religion que Kurelek va trouver sa voie et sa conscience. Ce qui est important dans ces trois œuvres c’est le changement de style de Kurelek, partant d’une technique qui regroupe plusieurs images en un seul tableau à des œuvres qui se concentrent plus sur un seul personnage qui le symbolise. D’autres changements de style concernent les couleurs utilisées, qui passent
d'une palette sombre et mélancolique à une autre avec des couleurs plus diversifiées soulignant une présence de la nature. Ce changement stylistique marque aussi un changement d’état d’esprit et de conscience du peintre et de l’individu Kurelek qui passe d’un être troublé à une personne saine grâce à sa conversion à la religion catholique romaine. Cet événement a éveillé sa conscience ethnique et diasporique, car il affirme dans son article les deux sont reliés; « To me, being a genuinely religious person is inextricably tied in with being an ethnic artist » (49). Ainsi, son statut diasporique comme Canadien et/ou Ukrainien passe à un statut de citoyen du monde. À cette époque Kurelek a décidé de dédier son talent artistique à la cause religieuse, et ce, en illustrant la Bible en une série de tableaux (Kurelek 49).

À sa rencontre avec Avrom Isaacs, un galeriste à Toronto avec qui il débute une série de peintures intitulée « Memories of Farm and Bush Life », la conscience diasporique de Kurelek va prendre une autre ampleur. En effet, cette série reconnaît un grand succès grâce auquel il sera nommé « farm painter » (Kurelek 50). Or, en voulant servir la cause religieuse, la deuxième série de Kurelek « Experiments in Didactic Art » va avoir moins de succès. Pour cette raison, avec un conseil d’une nouvelle amie Helen Cannon, il décidera de joindre l’utile à l’agréable. En d’autres termes, il présente ce que le public aime, c'est-à-dire la vie des immigrants et de la culture ukrainienne en insérant sa touche religieuse; d’où la série dédiée à son père intitulée « An Immigrant Farms in Western Canada » en 1963. Puis, il consacre une autre série nommée « Ukrainian Pioneer Woman in Canada » à sa mère en 1966. Un exemple qui illustre bien ce double message ethnique/religieux est l’œuvre intitulée « In The Autumn of Life » dans laquelle la religion est présentée, selon Jo Hughes, par « le Crucifié sur un arbre mort, sans feuille, est entouré de chiens affamés » (203). Alors que la partie ethnique se manifeste dans la présence familiale, symbolisant la famille de Kurelek, en train de se prendre en photo. Ainsi, Kurelek, toujours fidèle à sa technique de
détail, regroupe tous ces éléments dans un style panoramique. Les deux séries montrent la volonté de Kurelek de narrer par le biais des images l’histoire de sa famille comme faisant partie des immigrés du Canada avec un style réaliste, naturaliste et le plus important humaniste (Jo Hughes 203).

Après le succès des deux séries dédiées à ses parents, Kurelek commence à se rendre compte de la place qu’occupe la culture ukrainienne dans sa conscience. En effet, un autre événement va intensifier cette conscience diasporique. Il s’agit de sa rencontre avec John Sims, un jeune Ukrainien admirateur de son travail artistique. Il va décider de réaliser un film sur la vie de Dmyto Kurelek (le père) en s’inspirant de sa série « An Immigrant Farms in Western Canada ». « The National Film Board » accepte de financer ce film qui raconte l’histoire du père de Kurelek incluant son arrivée au Canada et les douloureux défis qu’il a rencontrés durant sa journée comme immigrant ukrainien au Canada. Effectivement, le film devient un succès international en accordant à Kurelek une bonne réputation parmi la communauté ukrainienne au Canada. Celle-ci va éprouver plus d’intérêt à ses réalisations artistiques soit en commandant des tableaux soit en les achetant. Dans les deux cas, la fierté de Kurelek et son identification à la communauté ukrainienne, va renforcer sa conscience diasporique. En effet, sa rencontre avec deux personnes ukrainiennes, Mykola et Olga KolianKiwsky, va jouer un rôle très important dans le processus de formation de sa conscience diasporique. À propos de cela, il dit : « another two new Canadians entered my life to further cement my position in the Ukrainian-Canadian community » (Kurelek 53). Ces deux galeristes ont proposé à Kurelek de faire une excursion en Ukraine dans le cadre d’un projet artistique. En fait, cette visite lui a permis de réaborder sa question identitaire « Am I Ukrainian or Canadian? » (Kurelek 53). Il affirme qu’il a trouvé la réponse non pas dans le pays lui-même (l’Ukraine), mais dans les petits villages, plus particulièrement dans celui de son père. Cette visite qui a
duré quatre heures représentait pour Kurelek la signification la plus ultime de sa vie « here were my ultimate roots » (53). Effectivement, à un moment donné durant ces quatre heures, Kurelek a voulu trouver ces racines ukrainiennes en mettant, littéralement, le visage dans le sillon fraîchement labouré en rassurant les gens inquiet pour lui : « i’m only searching for my roots » (Rak, par. 32). Julie Rak explique que cette anecdote représente la volonté incessante de Kurelek de trouver ce qui est perdu c'est-à-dire ses origines. Ainsi, ajoute-t-elle : « these acts build an identity that remains strategic, unfinished, open, [...] an identity that is a complex mix of family tensions, religious interpretations, and a story of immigration » (par. 32). Cette complexité peut être comprise du point de vue de Rajiva, comme une projection de la deuxième génération d’une diaspora sur les différentes difficultés rencontrées par la première génération : « second generation subjects live migration and its attendant struggles and successes, through their parents' experiences » (Rajiva 17). La série « The Ukrainian Pioneer » raconte l’histoire des immigrés ukrainiens et leur arrivée au Canada à travers trois tableaux. Il s’agit premièrement de l’œuvre intitulée « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 2 » qui décrit d’une manière claire le mouvement migratoire par la présence de deux rives séparées par la mer qui s’avère très vaste afin de mettre en évidence la longue distance de la séparation. Deuxièmement, « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 5 » est un tableau qui montre l’arrivée d’une famille ukrainienne dans un milieu anglo-saxon d’où, la présence d’un chariot traditionnel ukrainien et le bus scolaire anglais qui symbolise le pays d’accueil. Troisièmement, le tableau « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 6 » incarne le mode de vie choisi par la communauté ukrainienne, celui de l’agriculture, ainsi que la réussite de cette communauté dans ce domaine, ce qui se manifeste au niveau du tableau par les grains dans la main du personnage. Cette série, parmi d’autres, montre à quel point l’œuvre artistique de Kurelek rentre dans le cadre de l’art diasporique qui,
selon Lemke, décrit le processus de migration de la séparation à l’installation dans un pays d’accueil sans oublier la dimension émotionnelle qui l’accompagne : « [diasporic aesthetic] portrays the act of crossing, the process of migration and what it means to live in a state of exile » (Lemke 140).

En outre, le cercle de la conscience diasporique se complète via l’expérience de Kurelek comme un mari et comme un père. En effet, Kurelek ajoute dans son article qu’il s’est marié à une femme canadienne en spécifiant « a Canadian girl of British origin » en mettant l’accent sur le fait qu’elle ne partage pas ses origines ukrainiennes. Il affirme que même ses enfants n’avaient pas l’intention d’apprendre sa culture, ce qui a contribué à la consolidation de sa conscience diasporique en décidant de préserver son identité Ukrainie de peur de tomber dans l’assimilation culturelle (Kurelek 54). Cette période de sa vie a été caractérisée par une fréquentation plus importante de la communauté ukrainienne et une immersion dans la culture de ses origines dans le but de pratiquer la langue et raviver sa mémoire ukrainienne. Parmi ses habitudes, il cite :

Some of my happiest moment were, and still are spent listening to Ukrainian music as i paint. I was getting closer to my heritage and further from my wife and family for the simple reason that they did not share my interest in the Ukrainian heritage. (Kurelek 54)

Ceci dit, Kurelek devient plus conscient de son identité diasporique qui est ukrainienne de base et d’origine, mais aussi canadienne. Cette dualité a été toujours présente dans l’œuvre artistique de Kurelek dans la mesure où il présentait les deux mondes, peut-être d’une manière inconsciente au début, avant de prendre conscience de ses origines et de son identité diasporique. En fait, il conclut son article avec une citation qui résume parfaitement sa conscience; englobant les deux cultures (Ukrainienne et
Canadienne) à travers une reconnaissance au pays d’accueil et une compassion envers la communauté Ukrainienne :

I have become more keenly aware of the differences between the two cultures and better able to represent that difference in my painting. Secondly, I have become more sympathetic with the émigré Ukrainian’s concern over the Russification of his motherland. Finally, my experience has helped me appreciate how fortunate I and other people of various origins are to be living in Canada. (Kurelek 55)

En guise de conclusion, nous retenons que le processus de formation de la conscience diasporique de William Kurelek est passé par une quête circulaire qui a commencé et fini par la même idée : il est conscient de sa culture ukrainienne et du contexte anglo-saxon dans lequel il vit, donc de son statut diasporique. En fait, sa quête a été marquée par plusieurs étapes et par une panoplie de rencontres jouant un rôle majeur dans sa vie, sa conscience et son style artistique. « Diasporas identities are those which are constantly producing and reproducing themselves anew, through transformation and difference » (Hall 120). Cette citation de Hall s’applique parfaitement sur le cas de Kurelek. Effectivement, durant toute sa vie, il a essayé de se trouver une identité, sur le plan psychologique, personnel et artistique. D’un côté, Kurelek est connu pour son style artistique narratif, lequel est passé d’une représentation sous forme de plusieurs images en un seul tableau à une autre, plus précise et focalisée sur un seul personnage, le plus souvent symbolisant sa personne. Cette transformation stylistique est aussi le résultat de sa quête identitaire qui a commencé dès son enfance. En effet, les thèmes choisis dans ses œuvres comme la perte, la quête, la nature, la religion et la culture ukrainienne, ainsi que le style artistique adopté; énigmatique (des œuvres chargées de détails et de symboles) et dichotomique (double message religieux/socioculturel), incarnent par excellence le processus de formation de sa conscience diasporique. Ceci dit,
ce processus peut paraître, dans un premier temps, comme n’ayant pas la réponse aux mêmes critères de notre définition initiale à savoir;

1. les circonstances ainsi que les causes de la séparation des communautés diasporiques de leur pays d’origine (le plus souvent c’est des conditions misérables de vie);
2. Les conditions d’intégration dans un pays d’accueil marquées par une certaine difficulté;
3. La volonté des communautés diasporiques de maintenir un lien entre eux au sein du pays d’accueil et avec le pays d’origine;
4. La relation intergénérationnelle de la diaspora entre acceptation et déni de leur condition diasporique.

Cependant, en nous basant sur l’importance de la relation complexe entre le peintre et son père et sur le fait qu’il s’identifie à lui, nous pouvons avancer que sa conscience diasporique a été déclenchée à travers le quatrième critère et renforcée par le troisième critère. C’est pour cette raison qu’il a voulu, surtout après sa visite en Ukraine, peindre l’histoire et le processus migratoire de sa communauté; « One day this giant mural series will be centered in Ottawa so that all Canadians and visitors from abroad can see the story of Ukrainian settlement and development » (Kurelek 54). Ainsi, la quête de conscience diasporique de Kurelek ne suit pas le même cheminement que notre définition, mais possède les mêmes éléments.

De plus, nous retenons que l’œuvre artistique de Kurelek rentre dans le cadre de l’art diasporique, qui selon Lemke se définit comme suit: « Diasporic art assumes a narrative mode to engage genealogies of suffering, hopes, desires, confusion, pain and loyalty » (Lemke 140). Effectivement, le style de Kurelek est purement narratif, car il raconte toujours une histoire; il met l’accent sur des images artistiques et métaphoriques. C’est un style qui
symbolise son état d’esprit, lequel est passé par des moments de confusion, de douleurs lors de son séjour psychiatrique et par des moments de fidélité à la communauté ukrainienne ainsi que par des moments de désir pour préserver et pour promouvoir sa culture d’origine.
**Ouvrages cités**


Rajiva, Mythili. « Better Lives: The transgenerational Positioning of Social Mobility in the South Asian Canadian Diaspora ». *Women’s Studies*


**Liste des œuvres artistiques étudiées par ordre d’analyse**

William Kurelek, « One Room School at Kaszuby »
1977
Technique mixte sur masonite
70.8 x 50.5 cm
Musée des beaux-arts de Hamilton, don de la Polish Alliance of Canada et Wintario, 1978 (77,54).

William Kurelek, « Behold Man Without God»
1955
aquarelle sur carton
108.5 x 72.5 cm
Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto; don de M. et Mme George G. Sinclair, 1982

William Kurelek, « I Spit On Life »
c. 1953-1954
aquarelle sur panneau
63.5 x 94.0 cm
Collection Adamson, Londres, R.-U.

William Kurelek, « Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man »
1950
huile sur masonite
65.5 x 59.6 cm
Collection privée
William Kurelek, « The Maze »
1953
Gouache sur panneau
91 × 121 cm
Bethlem Royal Hospital in London

William Kurelek, « Pre-Maze »
c. 1953
aquarelle et graphite sur papier
25.3 x 37.7 cm
Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto; don de la collection de Bruno M. et Ruby Cormier, 1983

c. 1953-1954
aquarelle sur papier
73.6 x 58.5 cm
American Visionary Art Museum, Baltimore; don de la collection d'Edward Adamson, Londres, R.-U.

William Kurelek, « Lord That I May See »
1955
aquarelle et gouache sur panneau de fibres
119.4 x 74.9 cm
Musée des beaux-arts de Montréal; achat de la collection d'œuvres d'art canadiennes de Saidye et Samuel Bronfman

William Kurelek, « In The Autumn of Life »
1964
huile sur panneau dur trempé
59.1 x 120.3 cm
Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto; don de la McLean Foundation, 1964 (Hamilton seulement)

William Kurelek, « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 2 »
1971, 1976
acrylique, graphite, crayon de couleur, (gouache et aquarelle?) sur masonite
152.5 x 121.5 cm
Musée des beaux-arts du Canada; transfert de la Chambre des communes du Parlement du Canada, 1990 (no. 30836.2)
William Kurelek, « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 5 »
1971, 1976
acrylique, graphite, crayon de couleur, (gouache et aquarelle?) sur masonite
152.5 x 121.5 cm
Musée des beaux-arts du Canada; transfert de la Chambre des communes du Parlement du Canada, 1990 (no. 30836.5)

William Kurelek, « The Ukrainian Pioneer No. 6 »
1971, 1976
acrylique, graphite, crayon de couleur, (gouache et aquarelle?) sur masonite
152.5 x 121.5 cm
Musée des beaux-arts du Canada; transfert de la Chambre des communes du Parlement du Canada, 1990 (no. 30836.6)
A Curious Discovery: The Greek Diaspora in Ottawa

By AIDA BEYROUTI

RéSUMÉ: Cette étude explore la mesure dans laquelle la diaspora grecque à Ottawa maintient une identité culturelle distincte et démontre à quel point ce groupe diasporique est intégré dans la culture canadienne. L’étude s’appuie sur des entrevues filmées comme une technique de recherche qualitative et révèle que la communauté grecque à Ottawa est bien intégrée dans la culture canadienne, mais garde des liens solides avec sa patrie ancestrale. De plus, cette recherche analysera les littératures existantes sur les notions de ‘culture’, ‘maison’ par rapport à ‘patrie’, ainsi que le rôle de la technologie et des médias comme des outils importants dans les relations de la diaspora.

MOTS-CLES: Diaspora, religion, tradition, culture, pays d’accueil/pays d’origine, Ottawa, entrevues, grecque-canadien

ABSTRACT: This research study explores the extent to which the Greek Diaspora in Ottawa maintains a cultural identity and reveals the extent to which this diasporic group is integrated into the mainstream Canadian host culture. The study relies on in-depth camera interviews as a qualitative research technique and shows that the Greek community in Ottawa is well integrated into the mainstream Canadian host culture but maintains strong ties to their ancestral homeland. The paper will also review and analyze existing literatures on notions of ‘culture’, ‘home’ versus ‘homeland’, and the role of technology and media as tools in diaspora relations.

KEY WORDS: Diaspora, religion, tradition, culture, host land/home land, Ottawa, interviews, Greek-Canadian
Introduction

When western thinkers reflect on Greek civilization, classical ideas predominantly come to mind such as mythology, philosophy, democracy, the Olympics, mathematics and sciences; the building blocks of Western civilization. Similarly, when scholars, anthropologists, ethnographers and sociologists, amongst others, think of the term ‘Diaspora’, a word of Ancient Greek origin, they tend to relate the term with every other diasporic group in society but the Greeks. The objective of this research study is to explore the extent to which the Greek Diaspora in Ottawa maintains a cultural identity and to reveal the extent to which this diasporic group is integrated into the mainstream Canadian host culture. To achieve the objective, I will be using in-depth interviews as a qualitative research technique. This paper will also review and analyze existing literatures on notions of ‘culture’, ‘home’ versus ‘homeland’, and the role of technology and media as tools in diaspora relations.

Qualitative Research Background

This research study was conducted using video interviews with men and women of Greek descent residing in the Ottawa Valley. The approach used in the selection procedure is snowball sampling. The sample size consisted of seven participants: Theo, Penny, Tom, Georges, Maria, Olga, and Alex. Three of the participants, Theo, Penny and Tom, are second-generation while the four others are first-generation. Their ages ranged between their thirties to sixties at the time of the interviews. Ten questions were designed to meet the objective of the study:

1. What are some of the main elements that form the Greek cultural identity?

2. What does it mean to be Greek to you?
3. How do you maintain a Greek cultural identity?
4. What does the notion of home mean to you?
5. What are some of the challenges you face today in maintaining your Greekness?
6. How would you define Canadian culture?
7. How do you create a balance or harmony between the two cultures, the Greek and Canadian culture, without losing your sense of obligation or belonging to either one?
8. How do political and economic events in Greece affect you?
9. What form of media do you use to follow Greek politics and other events affecting Greece?
10. Do you participate in Greek politics? If so, how?

To ensure that the research is conducted according to ethical principles, I obtained authorization from the Research Ethics board through my course professor. The filming took place at various locations including the researcher’s residence and the interviewee’s home or workplace to accommodate each person’s schedule. All participants speak English and Greek. Participants come from various work industries including real estate, technology, education, religion and the government.

**Limitations**

Although seven people participated in this research study, the sample size is relatively small and was not chosen through the random sample technique which offers “the greatest assurance that those selected are a representative sample of a larger group.” (Bouma, Ling, & Wilkinson,
It is worth noting, that the findings of the study cannot necessarily be generalized to the Vancouver, Montreal or Toronto Greek-Canadian communities. The study does however apply to the experiences of the Greek-Canadians who participated in this research. In addition, the film produced can be used as a guide for scholars wishing to produce their own films or to further study this group.

**A Brief History of Greeks in Canada**

Greek immigration to Canada began in the early-to mid-nineteenth century shortly after the Greek War of Independence against the Turks in 1821. The earliest emigrants were largely men of poor educational, professional background from the Peloponnese, Crete, Syros and other regions of Northern Greece seeking economic opportunities. From 1905 onwards, women and families began arriving. With Greek emigration slowly increasing, many settled primarily in the urban cities of Vancouver, Montreal and Toronto. (Chimbos, 1980, p. 89)

The largest influx of Greek immigrants to Canada occurred in the post-WWII period where over 100,000 Greeks arrived to Canada (Chimbos, 1980). This occurrence was motivated by ‘push’ and ‘pull’ factors. Push factors included the Nazi and Italian occupation of Greece, a civil war, as well as economic hardship as a consequence of these horrific events causing the dispersion of many Greeks mainly across Canada, the United States and Australia. The pull factors on the other hand, included Canada’s open border policies, particularly to Europeans, due to post-WWII economic boom that necessitated cheap workers for labour-intensive industries. To overcome the challenges of adjusting to the adopted homeland, community organizations and Greek Orthodox churches were founded to provide support and a sense of solidarity for newly arrived and existing emigrants. The first two organizations, Anagenesis (Regeneration), and Patris (Motherland), were
established in 1905 in Montreal for the maintenance of the Greek culture. In 1906, the first Greek Orthodox Church was inaugurated in Montreal and in 1929, the Hellenic Community of Ottawa was established.

**A Reflection of Diaspora**

A ‘diaspora’ is a term with many contested meanings. A number of experts in the field on diaspora studies describe the concept as “ethnic groups that have been territorially dispersed across different nations due to ethnopolitical persecution or for economic reasons and are united by a sense of attachment to and longing for their homeland” (Cohen, Safran, Tölöyan, Van Hear, quoted in Tsuda, 2009, p.1). Similarly, Gabriel Sheffer defines the term as “a socio-political formation of an ethno-national group created as a result of either voluntary or forced migration, whose members regard themselves from the same ethno-national origin and who permanently reside as minorities in one or several host countries” (Sheffer, 2003, p. 10). Contrary to what many contemporary scholars believe, to Sheffer, the concept of diaspora is an ancient phenomenon whose roots extend as far as the Jewish and Greek antiquities. Other scholars such as Tololyan have even stretched the meaning of the term to adapt it to diasporic communities of multiple generations while using the term, “diasporama”.

I chose to focus on William Safran’s definition who explains the term ‘diaspora’ as a group of dispersed people sharing six characteristics that touch on the physical and psychological aspects of a diasporic community. For the purpose of this study, I selected five characteristics that best fit the Greek diaspora in Ottawa: 1) the scattering of people from the country of origin to foreign places, 2) maintaining memory of the homeland with the hope of returning in the future, 3) considering homeland as the true
home, 4) committing to the well-being of the homeland, 5) furthering relations with their country of origin (Safran, 1991).

**Literature Review**

To understand the cultural identity of a diasporic group, it is critical to define the concept of ‘culture’. Anthropologists define the term as “a system that includes beliefs, traditions, performances, art forms, symbols, language, music, and any other mode of human expressive, intellectual, and communicative behaviour associated with a community” (Danesi, 2008, p. 2). To this end, culture is a form of association and a means for identification of a social group’s past, present and future. Connected to ‘culture’ is the concept of a person’s native place, the ‘homeland’. Scholars on the topic of diaspora or migration tend to use the terms ‘home’ and ‘homeland’ interchangeably in literature. Though both terms are closely linked to a person and a place and to the general idea that home is located in the homeland, they do, however, imply different meanings particularly when used in the context of migration (Markowitz & Stefansson, 2004). The notion of homeland is linked to a place of origin. It is “a place that gives the individual or community their primary sense of identity” (Markowitz & Stefansson, 2004, p. 41) ‘Homeland’ involves deep emotional attachment as it becomes a place of exile and part of the diaspora’s past (Markowitz & Stefansson, 2004). ‘Home’, is simply a familiar place where a person resides and feels comfortable and safe. It is generally linked to the present period. Homeland when used in connection to a diasporic group implies ‘rupture’ from one’s place of origin and becomes a symbolic place filled with emotions and meanings. Homeland is often constructed in the imagination of a diasporic mind as the ideal place to return to someday. However, when the diasporic individual returns to their homeland, they often learn that the
constituted image in their imagination does not resemble the real place (Markowitz & Stefansson, 2004).

Today, ‘homeland’ is brought closer due to technology that creates new spaces beyond physical ones for the sharing of experiences and connections with family, friends and loved ones. Media such internet, mobile and satellite have become new “socio-cultural environments” for expressing one’s culture and identity. According to Mantonavi, media tools have contributed to “intercultural processes that embody a narrative, pluralistic, open concept of culture” (2012, p.21) and permits for the mixing of ideas, experiences and imaginations. Similarly, Panagakos’ research study on the effects of technology on the Greek ethnic community in Canada reveals that the use of technology and media instruments signals the creation of new dimensions to Greek diasporic identity and implies stronger ties with the homeland and other diasporic communities: “Greeks all over the world, creating a global Greek village.” (Panagakos, 2003, p.202). Pertierra examines the role of communication and media effects on identities using the case of the Filipino Diaspora in North America. He contends that “societies and information technologies engage dialogically, where each is shaped by the needs of the other.” (2012, p.108) Modern Communication tools such as mobile phones and internet contribute to the construction of narrative and imaginary spaces that connect the diasporic community to their root identity. Hafkin discusses the benefit of communication technology as a community builder for dispersed Ethiopians and as a key tool for the development of a transnational identity (2011).
Research Analysis

In the literature discussed above, I will analyze and interpret some of the Greek diaspora concepts and apply them to the interviews conducted. Danesi’s formulation of the concept of ‘culture’ as a system of shared elements and practices can be applied to the studied Greek cultural group of Ottawa. The diasporic group’s cultural identity consists of four core elements: family, language, religion and history. All participants in the interviews recognized these elements as an expression of their Greekness. As a distinct community in a highly diverse society, preserving the root identity is a challenge. To encourage the preservation of their cultural identity, the Greek Community Organization in Ottawa and the Hellenic Orthodox Church play a critical role in promoting ancestral culture and traditions while emphasizing the importance of continuing involvement in the Canadian society to prevent the formation of enclaves. The Greek language school encourages children and adults to develop their language skills and to foster social relations with other members of the community. Other organized activities include traditional dancing, Sunday school, sports teams and other social events while the church serves as a symbol of unity. By reproducing aspects of the Greek tradition and heritage in the host society, diasporic members establish a profound sense of belonging to the ethnic community and connect to their homeland. This diasporic group provides its members a forum to socialize and build relations with other Greek-Canadians in Ottawa as a way of maintaining their Greek culture.

In Safran’s ‘myth of return’, the majority of the participants interviewed, particularly the first generation, regarded Greece as an ideal homeland to return to permanently in the future, but did acknowledge that the political and economic environment in the hostland distorted the idealistic image formed in their mind about their ancestral home. Instead,
many opted for a temporary return to visit family and friends. Many participants used the terms “home” and “homeland” interchangeably and related both terms to family and roots. The majority of participants regarded home as more than just simply a place of residence. Instead they contended that home is inseparable from familial relationships. To the participants, particularly of the first generation, home is a fragmented space that lies between two distinct geographical places tied together by familial connections. Tom, for example, noted that “home is where the family is, this can be in Canada or anywhere else.” To Maria, “home is where the heart and soul is”, adding that “home is having one foot in Canada and the other in Greece”. To Maria, home is a place in-between.

Furthermore, when participants were asked to discuss the difference between Greek and Canadian cultural values, virtually all participants regarded Greek familial ties and loyalties as superior to Canadian ones. Theo, for instance, mentioned that Greek families “are more closely-knit, tend to celebrate more family-related events together and stay closely connected to cousins and siblings.” Penny spoke of “knowing her first, second, third and fourth cousins” as a way to expressing greater family values. Similarly, a comparative study conducted on Greeks in Australia revealed that “the Greek-Australians regard their own loyalty to family as superior to the attitudes of less familial Anglo-Celts.” (Bottomley, 1992, p.57)

As noted in previously discussed literature, technologies such as Skype, Facetime and Tango provide visual connections that paradoxically can both alleviate and exacerbate nostalgia for the homeland. The exposure to televised cultural programs and global online news outlets strengthens the diaspora attachment to their ancestral home. Concerning the form of media and technology the participants follow for socio-political and economic events in Greece, the conducted interviews support the literature analysis. The majority of respondents confirmed using either the internet or satellite
television or both as the main outlets for keeping up with homeland events and family. These mediums of communication affected them in different ways. First-generation participants were directly impacted by Greek events due to their extended familial ties in the country of origin while second-generation participants were affected indirectly. Furthermore, the first-generation relied on satellite television primarily to keep informed of homeland events while the second generation favored the use of internet. The results of my qualitative research coincide with Panagakos study of the Greek community in Calgary, confirming that the second generation favoured the use of the internet over satellite television. Only 15% of second and third generation Canadian-Greeks watched Greek news through satellite television compared to 54% of first generation. This gap may be due to the language element.

Conclusion

The research study revealed that the Greek community in Ottawa is well-integrated in the mainstream host culture. This group embraces Canada’s values of diversity and equity that allow for the maintenance of their cultural identity and the ability to transmit their language, heritage and traditions to future generations of Greek-Canadians. The study explored the shared elements of the Greek culture such as family, history, language and religion. This system of cultural reference is used by the Greek community to establish a profound sense of belonging and links to the homeland. Common practices such as Greek language learning and participation in religious and socio-cultural activities are key to retaining an ethnic identity in a highly diverse society. My qualitative interview findings reveal that home is often used synonymously with family to stress the significance of the closeness of familial relationships. The use of media and technology connect the diasporic

50
community to their ancestral traditions, enabling them to overcome geographical distances. Tools, such as the internet, facilitate the creation of virtual spaces for the sharing of experiences and to gain knowledge on homeland affairs, but this can paradoxically both diminish and increase longing for the homeland.
Appendix A: Questionnaire

Objectives of the study

- To strengthen the academic community’s knowledge of the Greek Diaspora in Ottawa.
- To determine how well the Greek Diaspora is integrated into the Canadian society (Host society).
- To explore some of the challenges the Greek community faces today in maintaining its cultural identity.
- To gain some understanding of how well the Greek community in Ottawa interacts with the homeland on a socio-political and economic level.

Cultural identity

- What are some of the main elements that form the Greek cultural identity?
- What does it mean to be Greek to you?
- How do you maintain a Greek cultural identity?
- What does the notion of home mean to you?
- What are some of the challenges do you face today in maintaining your Greekness?

Canada’s culture (Host land)

- How would you define the Canadian culture?
- How do you create a balance or harmony between the two cultures, the Greek and Canadian culture, without losing your sense of obligation or belonging to either one?
**Transnational politics/Economics**

- How do political and economic events in Greece affect you?
- What form of media do you use to follow Greek politics and other events affecting Greece?
- Do you participate in Greek politics? If so how?
Works Cited


Une exploration de l'Autre dans une nation, en soi-même et la nature de l'Autre lui-même.

An exploration of the Other within a nation, within the self, and the nature of the Other itself.
Can Intolerance Inspire Economics? How Marketers Manipulate Multiculturalism to Sell Real Estate

By TAHHINA REZA

RéSUMÉ : L'inaccessibilité croissante des maisons de la région métropolitaine de Vancouver a soulevé des questions sur la cause de la hausse des prix. Nombreux, y compris les commerçants de l’immobilier et des médias du grand public à travers les actualités, ont pointé que la cause était le flux des capitaux étrangers et particulièrement des «chinois» riches. Cette étude explore l'utilisation ambiguë et interchangeable des «chinois» et de la double identité multiculturelle «chinoise-canadienne». Elle analyse les réponses des lecteurs canadiens des histoires des actualités à la fois des médias alternatifs et du grand public. Elle examine les messages de la commercialisation de l’immobilier, et décompose les tendances des rapports des médias. L’étude conclut que les commerçants de l’immobilier profitent de l’intolérance de l’Autre pour promouvoir les ventes de logements aux canadiens n’ayant pas une double identité. L’étude constate, en outre, que les médias écrivent d’un point de vue narratif du groupe dominant, ce qui suggère que jusqu’à ce que tous les canadiens soient considérés comme des canadiens à part entière il y a encore place pour exploiter l’Autre pour un avantage économique.

MOTS-CLES : Chinois, Chinois-canadien, multiculturalisme, immobilier, marketing, médias

ABSTRACT: The growing unaffordability of houses in the Greater Vancouver area has prompted questions about the cause of rising prices. Many, including real estate marketers and mainstream news media, point to the flow of foreign money and particularly rich “Chinese” as the cause. This study explores the ambiguous and interchangeable use of “Chinese” and the multicultural dual identity “Chinese Canadian.” It analyzes Canadian reader responses to news stories from both alternative and mainstream media, examines real estate marketing messaging, and breaks down mainstream media reporting trends. The study finds that real estate marketers commodify the existing intolerance of the Other to promote home sales to unhyphenated Canadians. It further finds that mainstream news media writes from the narrative view point of this dominant group, suggesting that until all Canadians are viewed as full Canadians there remains room to exploit the Other for economic benefit.

KEY WORDS: Chinese, Chinese-Canadian, multiculturalism, marketing, news media
Introduction

Critiques of Canadian multiculturalism often include the disadvantaging of ethnic groups, racialized people and communities that are in some way Other than the normative population. Yet is it possible that they are not the only ones multiculturalism disadvantages? A study done for the Vancouver Centre of Excellence found that British Columbians generally supported multiculturalism with a 1990 Environics poll suggesting 91 percent viewed B.C. as a “multicultural society” (qtd. in Mahtani and Mountz 14). However that sentiment has been shown to change. In circumstances of economic hardship, such as high unemployment, anti-immigration sentiment also increased (Mahtani and Mountz 14). Mahtani and Mountz show that economics can inspire intolerance, but is the reverse also true? Can intolerance inspire economics? A June 2014 article in the Vancouver Sun identified Vancouver as the most expensive North American city to live in (Yaffe, “American”). For many, including the sources cited in the article, foreign investment or more specifically ‘hot Asian money’ is to blame. Although foreign investment may be among the many factors driving Vancouver real estate, I will show that disingenuous real estate marketers, through a lazy news media, use the “Chinese Canadian” dual identity to manipulate demand among Canadian buyers.

Multiculturalism as a theory, concept and policy may have lost its popularity (Mahtani and Mountz 5), but it still exists in the collective conscious and behaviours of those who grew up with it. The Canadian Multiculturalism Act (1988) states,

3. (1) It is hereby declared to be the policy of the Government of Canada to

(a) recognize and promote the understanding that multiculturalism reflects the cultural and racial diversity of Canadian society and acknowledges the
freedom of all members of Canadian society to preserve, enhance and share their cultural heritage; (Canadian Multiculturalism Act)

The recognition part of the policy has been widely applied to Canada's many ethnolinguistic groups, including Canadians of Chinese descent. Wing Chung Ng notes that they didn’t use the designation as a group identifier until it was adopted during the process of establishing Canadian Multiculturalism (104). “As far as the Chinese are concerned, the policy of multiculturalism was pivotal in the development of the category of Chinese Canadian” (100).

Canadians who grew up during the implementation of multiculturalism during the 1970’s, 1980’s and 1990’s, today form a significant portion of the society's decision makers, influencers and money spenders. Despite a reduction in reference to multiculturalism as a policy, this cohort has retained some of its values and practices, including recognizing Canadians of various ethnic backgrounds as ethnic-Canadians and referring to them through a multicultural dual identity. Whether Canadians “promote the understanding that multiculturalism reflects the cultural and racial diversity of Canadian society” or not will be explored in this paper.

First, I will examine marketing manipulation with respect to the Greater Vancouver real estate industry. This will include exploring responses to a marketing scam acknowledged in mainstream media, looking at other instances of the disingenuous marketing identified by independent bloggers but left unacknowledged by mainstream media, and analyzing the messaging of real estate marketing in mainstream media. The study will then shift to look at how Vancouver news media facilitates the story of Chinese buyers driving up real estate. To demonstrate this I will analyze the way television media provides a pervasive and effective telling of Chinese buyer culpability,
conduct a frame analysis of Vancouver’s largest two print mediums, and assess the sources news media uses and the narratives they provide.

**Real Estate Marketers Manipulate the Multicultural Dual Identity to Rouse Sales**

“The basic tool for the manipulation of reality is the manipulation of words. If you can control the meaning of words, you can control the people who must use the words.” Philip K. Dick (Dick Introduction)

In marketing, what is being sold is not necessarily the product or service in question. A commodity is any economic good that has an exchange value and can be bought or sold (Jackson et al. 61). By this definition audiences can be commodities, a product of immense value for marketers. “[C]onsumption can be social, cultural, psychological, economic, political and historical” (80). Further, marketing creates “commodity images in association with personal emotions, values and relationships that camouflage the real demand for commercial interests” (80). According to Peter Drucker “[t]he aim of marketing is to know and understand the customer so well the product or service fits him and sells itself” (qtd. in Kotler 33). The question when looking at real estate marketing in Vancouver becomes; which consumers are marketers targeting, and what emotions values and relationships are being sold?

Marketers use manipulative tactics such as lying about nationality to promote sales, faking “proof” of an upcoming Asian invasion, implying the need to buy now, and disseminating opinions that drive demand through race-based fear. A February 2013 CTV news story titled, *Fake Buyers*, tells how two young women who are a part of the real estate marketing industry duped CTV into believing they were condo shoppers from China (CTV, “Fake
Buyers”). The newscast shows two women of Asian ethnicity, one who spoke with an accent, saying “I’m from China and that is my sister Amanda. So we are looking for a place together” (CTV, “Fake Buyers”). They said their parents, in town for Chinese New Year, would pay for it. “If we like this place, we have to tell them and they make the decision. Usually Chinese people like to buy during this time” (CTV, “Fake Buyers”). Bloggers revealed that Amanda Lee is an administrative assistant for Maddox, the condo development being “considered for purchase” (Whispers). The newscast interviewed MAC Marketing CEO Cameron McNeill who admitted that the “[t]wo young women featured in the story are employees of MAC” (CTV, “Fake Buyers”). McNeill said he wasn’t present the past weekend when the scam occurred, that he didn’t know whether it was spontaneous or contrived, and that he was trying his best to figure that out. Lindsay Meredith, a Simon Fraser University marketing professor, theorized that “they were trying to make it look like there were still good, active Chinese buyers here so that keeps the pressure on the potential buyers to get in, slap down the money and make the purchase” (CTV, “Fake Buyers”). The report ended with, “He [McNeill] says there has been an influx of Asian buyers in the past few weeks, but these two women are not among them” (CTV, “Fake Buyers”). CBC British Columbia and the Vancouver Sun were also among the media outlets duped by MAC Marketing (CBC British Columbia “Real estate”; Penner).

In the presence of a proven marketing scam to deceive the public, journalists and editors across various news outlets who did not check their sources, and the use of visible ethnicity to sell a story about Chinese buyers, one could assume Canadians would reserve their frustration and resentment for marketers and news media, but my commenter analysis of Canadian responses shows that some still choose to blame the “Chinese.” In order to explore Canadian responses to the MAC Marketing deception, I selected
three online versions of the story that had their comments section open. I assessed poster comments for Canadian nationality. Statements such as “I was born in Vancouver,” hints such as “I have more than that just in my TFSA” referring to a Tax Free Savings Account which only Canadians may apply for, and possessive language with respect to Canadian society, geography, politics or economics such as “I thought we "built a country," so our children could have a better life,” indicated Canadian nationality. My analysis is summarized in Table 1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Vancouver Sun</th>
<th>The Globe and Mail</th>
<th>Huffington Post</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Comments</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian identified Comments</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinct Canadian identified commenters</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigners</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese or Hot Asian Money (HAM)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAM + Foreigners = Foreign problem</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locals</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media + R.E. + Gov’t + Locals = Can problem</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Canadian = Chinese</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defends immigrants/immigration</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defends foreigners/foreign investment</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Canadian = Chinese</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 – Analysis of Canadian Commenter Response in Mainstream Media

Only ~7 percent of comments self-identified as Canadian (12/176), but 50 percent of those that did blamed hot Asian money, Chinese or foreigners for the price of inflated real estate (6/12). Approximately 33 percent, (2/6) of those comments exhibited an assumption that people who looked visibly
Chinese were in fact of Chinese nationality instead of being open to the idea that they might be Canadian. Last, one comment, 8 percent of Canadian-identified responses, clarified (to a non-identified-Canadian commenter) that Chinese looking, or in this case sounding, was not the same as Chinese (nationality): “My name is a "Chinese language name" and I was born in Vancouver, so am I an overseas investor?”

Analysis of a comment where Chinese and Chinese Canadian seem to blend into one undifferentiated identity, demonstrates the kind of mindset where the idea of multicultural diversity reflecting Canadian society is notably absent. The comment “Sad part is there is someone arriving from China daily to buy our real estate, land, businesses, natural resources and most importantly our POLITICIANS!!” indicates both a possible exaggeration and on some level, the ability to “see” proof of Chinese nationals. In the case of the latter, the commenter cannot know that a person from China is buying real estate daily or otherwise, because foreign purchases are not tracked in BC (Woo “Scant Evidence”; Turner, “Gullible”). He or she is speaking from a place of opinion, an inference based on what he or she sees or assumes. Ethnic Chinese are Vancouver’s largest minority group and constitute about 30 percent of the population of the Greater Vancouver Area (GVA) (StatsCan, “Canada’s Ethnocultural Mosaic”). If the commenter resided in Vancouver, about one in three people he or she sees could be assumed to be yet another person from China arrived to “buy our real estate.” In Stats Canada’s definition, population includes, “all Canadian citizens, landed immigrants, and non-permanent residents whose annual place of residence is in that community” (StatsCan, Census Variables). Thus populations includes Canadians and “potential/would be Canadians” (Hier and Greenberg 499). The word usage in Canada’s Census 2006 document, Canada’s Ethnocultural Mosaic, summarized in Table 2, also gives us an idea of how this Canadian-
identified commenters may have developed his or her confusion between Chinese ethnicity and nationality:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor</th>
<th>Reference to Ethnicity w/out Descriptor</th>
<th>Ethnicity as Identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| "...ethnic origins were Chinese..."| "...visible minority group was Chinese."
                                    | "The 407,200 Chinese in British Columbia..."
| "...reporting Chinese ethnicity..."| "Chinese as their visible minority group..."
                                    | "...of Chinese were foreign born."
| "...Chinese or East Indian origins..."| "Among the foreign born Chinese..."
| "ethnic origins reported... Chinese"|                                        |
| "ethnic ancestry reported were British Isles"|                                |
| "ethnic origins...English"|                                        |
| "British Isles descent."|                                        |
| "British Isles origins were foreign born"|                                    |
| "...of British Isles origin."|                                        |

Table 2 – Usage of “Chinese” and “British Isles”/“English” in StatsCan 2006: Canada’s Ethnocultural Mosaic, 2006 Census: Provinces and territories, British Columbia

In documenting the ethnic makeup of British Columbia, every reference to “British” or “English” has a descriptor added, indicating the reference to an ancestry, ethnicity, descent or origin such that ethnicity does not get confused with nationality. Comparatively equal numbers of references to “Chinese” used a descriptor (ethnic origins, ethnicity, origins) to indicate ethnicity and didn’t. Four references identified the population group as simply “Chinese.” Perhaps the most telling comparison is the language usage when referring to those foreign born within each ethnic group. The report refers to “Chinese” without a descriptor to clarify, when speaking of foreign born. When speaking of “British Isles” foreign born people, the report added the word “origins” which provided those of British background some level of distance from ethnic origin that was not afforded in references to the “Chinese” foreign born. The emphasis on “Chinese foreign born” creates a question of their belonging though a significant number are second, third, or fourth generation Canadian (Creese and Peterson 121). This document, prepared for the Government of Canada, shows that while the intent of
multiculturalism may be to recognize diversity and promote inclusion in Canadian society, the practice of over emphasizing the ethnic background of visible minorities goes to the point of excluding them from being of Canadian nationality. Considering government and media precedence in confusing ethnicity for identity in Chinese Canadians, it is understandable how some Canadian-identified commenters would also have difficulty seeing Chinese-Canadians as Canadians, and perceive an inflated number of Chinese nationals to be present and driving up the price of real estate.

In the above example, Canadians learned of an instance of deception in mainstream media, but independent bloggers allege there are other examples where marketers fake news and push “proof” of an upcoming Asian invasion in their quest to pressure the Canadian public to purchase high priced homes. Independent bloggers have accused Cam Good, President of Key Marketing, of deceiving media by planting a sister company employee, Tara Fluet, as an “investor” in a Global News story, and fostering a myth that Chinese buyers are flooding out locals (VREA, “Global TV”; Turner, “Bad dogs”). In the case of Good’s employee posing as an investor, when questioned by Glen Korstrom of biv.com [Business in Vancouver], Good responded through email saying, “Tara apologizes for this lack of transparency. It was [a matter of] an off-duty salesperson from a related company stopping by an event to check it out and happy to answer questions when asked. It wasn’t intentional media manipulation” (Korstrom). Fluet’s willingness to withhold pertinent information, like her connection to the promotion she was endorsing to the public suggests a lack of integrity, as does Good’s response as he tries to minimize the importance of transparency in news media. While this example demonstrates the willingness to deceive in order to make sales, the second instance deals directly with representations of Chinese and Chinese Canadians. On April 12, 2012 Global News BC ran a six minute and thirty eight second story by Jaz Johal called,
“Rich Asians Buying B.C. Real Estate by Helicopter” (Global News, “Rich Asians”). The story features passengers from China flying by helicopter to see a $14 million dollar home “as a weekend place as they already own property on the west side of Vancouver.” Johal states, “This year he [Good] expects to conduct over 100 similar tours, with most of his buyers coming from China. All are interested in buying real estate in BC… These Asian buyers have allowed us to film their trip, but don’t wish to speak on camera.” Good speaks for them, saying,

One of them’s north of a billion, and a couple others are in the several hundreds of millions in this example, but beyond that, their names and who they are and what they do and what not, it’s best kept private…Chinese are buying Vancouver, both West and East side. West Vancouver, Richmond and Coquitlam. (Global News, “Rich Asians”)

Garth Turner of greaterfool.ca accuses Good of the intent to “feed the meme that legions of oriental Donald Trumps were about to gobble up the region, pricing out locals forever” (Turner, “Myth”).

With independent bloggers so vocally critical of both marketing manipulation and xenophobia, one would think that the commenters on their blogs would show more tolerance, but my analysis shows that this is not the case. Again, I sought stories revealing the MAC Marketing scam, assessed their commenters for Canadian nationality, and analyzed the comments. This time I used the blogs greaterfool.ca, a daily real estate web blog, and Whispers from the Edge of the Rainforest, an anonymous independent blog, and the one credited with breaking the MAC Marketing scandal. Table 3 summarizes what I found:
Only 1 comment from *Whispers on the Edge of the Rainforest* identified as Canadian, so the following analysis mostly reflects Turner’s post on greaterfool.ca. Again, ~7 percent of comments self-identified as Canadian (18/260), this time with less people who blamed Chinese/foreigners for inflated real estate, down to ~33 percent or (6/18) from 50 percent. However, here ~66 percent or (4/6) of comments that blamed Chinese/foreign money, also confused Chinese Canadian with Chinese, up from 33 percent when compared to commenter responses to stories on mainstream media outlets. This, despite the fact that Turner addresses the issue of ethnicity versus nationality head on in his post, “[s]o ingrained is that notion now that people born in Canada, of Asian heritage, are routinely labeled HAM [hot Asian money] and lumped in with offshore investors” (Turner, *Myth*). Also worth noting is ~17 percent or (3/18) comments,
attempting to clarify to other commenters that Chinese Canadian was not the same as Chinese.

Multiculturalism has highlighted the ethnicities of various groups, but has not been successful promoting and facilitating the acceptance of those groups in Canadian society, even in the comments section of an independent blog that encourages this acceptance and labels xenophobic practices as harmful:

And a load of folks obviously do not distinguish between Chinese people (from China) who buy up properties here and other Chinese people (from Richmond or Unionville) who were raised locally and just want a house. Of course the latter are not Chinese. They’re Canadian. Get over it. (Turner, “Gullible”)

Independent blogger criticism cannot compete with audiovisual clips of “Chinese” millionaires when “Chinese” is used interchangeably with Canadians of Chinese origin by government, media and individuals. Nor can lone voices compete with mindsets shaped by multiculturalism. Neil Bissoondath writes,

I am uncertain, then, as to the precise meaning of phrases such as African-Canadian or Italian-Canadian or Greek-Canadian... Their principal effect, I would suggest, is not to define the word “Canadian” but to mark a distance from it, the hyphen that links them a sign of an acceptable marginalization. (Bissoondath 108)

The distance from Chinese Canadian to Chinese is not far. In fact, a study done on Canadian media representations of dual identities found that references to Ben Johnson, after he won a gold medal, included 65 percent referring to him as Canadian and 15 percent referring to him as Jamaican. After his drug use was revealed and he was stripped of his medal, media references to Johnson as Canadian dropped to 30 percent and references to
him as a Jamaican increased to 30 percent (Stelzl). This finding of media references matches another study of Canadian attitudes measured through polls conducted over the 1990’s. The study showed that Canadian attitudes towards immigration policy fluctuated, with immigration support becoming “very soft” and “easily turned to opposition as negatively-portrayed events occur” (Mahtani and Mountz 13-14). Anti-immigrant sentiment particularly increased with the perception of economic competition with immigrants (12). The efforts of real estate marketers to pit “Chinese” buyers against local ones combined with the fluctuating acceptance of immigrants and the reality of multiculturalism – where ethnic Canadians can easily be reduced to their ethnic identifier – creates the perfect conditions for exclusion. People who would like to purchase real estate, including those who read critical real estate blogs, but cannot afford to buy are instead able to partake in the Canadian trend of blaming the Other, even if some of those “others” are Canadians themselves.

In addition to real estate marketing scams, marketers are also given space in local news to sell the story of an Asian invasion. Opinion editorials (op-eds) give individuals outside the media the opportunity to share ideas with the public without having to source facts that support the opinions being expressed. The Vancouver Sun published an op-ed by Cam Good on April 21, 2014 titled, “The new real estate protectionism is misguided.” In it Good talks about his company’s real estate selling success, particularly with the “Chinese.”

In the last two months, we’ve sold over 700 condos in Toronto. Sixty per cent went to Mainland Chinese buyers. In meccas like Richmond, 98 per cent of the hundreds of homes we’ve sold are to buyers who are Chinese…. Buyers from Mainland China are a driving force in our real estate market. The staggering truth is we’ve seen just the tip of the iceberg. (Good)
In the op-ed Good praises the Chinese, chastises locals for resenting Chinese buyers, argues against the calls to impose foreign buyer restrictions, expresses his intolerance for anti-immigrant attitudes and closes with,

If you suffer from real estate impotence, don't blame Chinese people. Besides, getting all worked up about it will only make it worse...Stop feeling sorry for yourself and pick up the phone to call a realtor or a mortgage broker, either of whom will be more than happy to show you how easy it can be to get your real estate groove on. Real estate is the best investment you'll ever make, but don't take my word for it. Ask any of the 70 per cent of Canadians who are already owners. Or a Chinese person. (Good)

Good gives the impression that he is an advocate and admirer of “the Chinese” and a pro-immigration supporter of diversity. However, like Canadian multiculturalism, Good recognizes the ethnic group but fails to promote a true acceptance of its members as Canadians.

Good's sincerity unravels by asking two simple questions, why did he write the op-ed and who does he mean by Chinese? First, why did he write the op-ed? If Good truly has so many mainland Chinese buyers snapping up real estate across Toronto and Vancouver, and those buyers are “just the tip of the iceberg,” why is he spending so much time and energy trying to get stories about his buyers into BC media? His company often solicits media attention to sell the story of the many sales they make to Chinese buyers. The fact that Good has launched a concerted media effort in BC shows that local buyers are one of his targets. It is through selling the story of “Chinese buyers” to the Canadian public that he gets more potential buyers bidding for limited property, pushing prices higher and netting himself more commission in the process. The second question asks, who does Good refer to when he says “Chinese”? In the entire op-ed, Good uses the words “Chinese Canadian”
once and the word “Chinese” fourteen times. In some cases, he is legitimately referring to people of Chinese nationality, and in other cases he is referring to people who could be either, yet he chooses to use “Chinese”. For example: “Chinese have made owning real estate in Canada more rewarding than any of us expected and they have made our society distinctively richer by bringing their values and culture to Canada and sharing them with us” (Good). Another example: “There are so many Chinese here already” (Good). Good confounds Chinese foreign buyers and Chinese immigrants who upon citizenship, become Canadian. For his purposes, Good counts them together to add up to proof that readers of his op-ed can “see.”

Rather than the valiant defender of immigration and open market practices he presents himself as, Good uses race-based marketing to instill fear in local buyers, encouraging them not to be left out by buying now. “Choosing a place is a matter of social trends and, even more so, the general stereotypes about the places image” (Avraham and Ketter 70). Since the image in Vancouver is one of unaffordability, marketers need a way to convince consumers to buy anyway. News stories usually only imply the need for locals to jump in and buy now before foreigners drive prices further up. By writing an op-ed, Good is able to complete the sales pitch by including a call to action that asks locals to compete. His op-ed’s “repeated reference to the fact that they were of ‘Chinese’ or ‘Asian’ origin, created an instant epistemological distinction between ‘Chinese’ and Canadian;, ‘Orient’ and ‘Occident’, ‘Us’ and ‘Them’.” (Hier and Greenberg 498). Good and many others manipulate the meaning of words so that Chinese means everyone who is ethnically Chinese, even if they are Canadian. And Canadian has been manipulated to mean those without an ascribed ethnic identity. Taking a closer look at the messaging of Good’s editorial shows that the product being sold is the area in and around Vancouver and local Canadians are being targeted as the consumer. Yet, in order to sell over-priced houses to everyday
people, marketers need to appeal to something bigger than the houses themselves. Thus, they create a commodity image, one that appeals to the social, cultural, psychological and political history of Canadians who are not hyphenated, considered ethnic or “foreign.” Hier and Greenberg have found that,

uncertainties concerning the resilience and adaptive capacity of [Euro]Canadian identity and hegemony have crystalized or intensified in the face of an upwardly mobile, financially successful, growing Chinese-Canadian population. (494)

Good’s commodity image solves the problem of [Euro]Canadian uncertainty by offering home ownership, at increasingly higher prices, as the solution. By this logic, if the Chinese are the Other competing for real estate, it is by dominating in the consumption of Vancouver that the “Canadian” can (re)find its Self. Real estate marketers manipulate, deceive, and sell Canadians the possibility of a socio-cultural reality that no longer exists, if it ever did. In the process, marketers sacrifice a true multicultural national identity and foster intolerance of Chinese Canadians in order to make sales.

**News Media Minus Integrity Fosters Intolerance and In Turn Profit**

“Every time you take a lump of material and turn it into something you are imposing a narrative. It’s a writer’s obligation to do this. And, by the same token, it is apparently a journalist’s obligation to pretend that he never does anything of the sort.” (Nora Ephron qtd. in Bennett 36)

How things are framed matters. Media frames are created by “selecting and highlighting some facets of events or issues, and making connections among them so as to promote a particular interpretation, evaluation, and/or solution” (Entman 5). Frames are not only a matter of
what is being asked, who is asking can also shape interpretations based on the inherent beliefs and understandings of the person phrasing the questions. For example, in critiquing the episode on multiculturalism of CTV’s news program, *W5*, Irshad Manji pointed out that the journalists who shaped the program were “protected by the common sense of whiteness” when asking the question, “does multiculturalism harm?” In Manji’s opinion, a more appropriate question would have been, “does multiculturalism harm ‘mainstream’ tolerance?” (qtd. in Mahtani and Mountz 6-7). Not only does the frame news media takes matter, it is also important to note the “theatre” media operates in. Journalism is a “performative discourse.” According to Broersma, this means “[n]ewspapers present a social map of reality to their readers day after day. They frame the social world in a professional discourse which has to convince readers that events occurred exactly as the newspaper describes” (qtd. in Shapiro 151). In Gramsci’s writings on hegemony, he says that it “is not maintained solely through institutions, beliefs, and ideologies. Rather, hegemony works through the “common sense” functioning of everyday life” (qtd. in Amarasingam 466). Marketers attempt to construct common sense meanings and realities through the words they use, but it is through the power of news media that these messages are convincingly disseminated and hegemonic discourses invisibly perpetuated.

News media uses various mediums to effectively persuade audiences of their messages, which become ingrained in the public consciousness, even if the facts provided by the sources behind the message are unsubstantiated. Television does not require sensational stories of millionaires/billionaires house hunting in helicopters for $14 million weekend homes in order to impress the idea of rich Chinese buying up Canadian land. The human brain does not compartmentalize information, but processes it in a continually integrated method across different kinds of
sensory input; therefore the words, sounds and sights TV provides stimulate the brain and reiterates the message being passed (Bennett 85). I will use a narrative analysis of a Global News BC clip, as well as provide an analysis of the text-to-audio-to-video to show how television media manipulation of the Chinese Canadian dual identity works toward real estate marketers goal to gain profit, rather than the news media’s responsibility to critically inform the public.

The Global News clip, “Mainland Chinese Buying West Van”, follows the frame set by the real estate industry, which is unsurprising considering both sources in the story are real estate agents with messages of massive sales to the Chinese, both present and future (Global, “Mainland Chinese”). In the clip, real estate agent Jill Wiersma says, "We've seen an incredible boom, largely driven by the mainland Chinese," and real estate agent Tim Slatter suggests there are more coming, "They're getting experienced with the lay of the land and that you get a lot more for your money over here." Image 1 shows the storyboard that was sandwiched between the two real estate agent’s comments:

Looking at the visual, the dilapidated house and the storyboard with the extraneous numbers beside the word Asian helps build the assumption that the house was sold to an Asian, though that is not outright said. Even if the buyer was not Asian, it is implied that the number of “Asians” bidding and
prospecting increased the price. The other, more pertinent assumption to the discussion on multiculturalism is that the people who are referred to as “Asian” over and over in text and audio are Asian by nationality as has been set in the frame of the story. Since nationality cannot be assessed visually, it can be assumed that either someone verified the nationality of all twenty-six people who put in offers, as well as fact-checked the nationality of all five hundred buyers, or whoever constructed these statistics worked based on the idea that if someone looked Asian ethnically, they were Asian by nationality. Since *Global News* did not cite a source where the information on the story-board came from, it’s impossible to know. The pace and multiple forms of stimulation of TV makes it possible or even likely that the viewer would not have noticed the unsourced buyer statistics and assumptions on the storyboard that were stated as facts. Thus as Stuart Hall notes, media will “play a constitutive, and not merely a reflexive, after-the-event role” in making the news (qtd. in Creese and Peterson 118).

Television media is able to (over)represent demand in West Vancouver with ease. The newscast analyzed, sourced and interviewed only one speculative investor from mainland China. Instead of viewing this Canadian resident as a potential or would-be Canadian (Hier and Greenberg 499), the reporter focused on her difference as someone from China, as someone exorbitantly rich, and as someone who left China to buy here, because China imposed homeownership restrictions. This woman was followed by a clip of three ethnically Asian people walking out of an open house. In the background, it’s possible to see that bodies are moving in the house, but not closely enough to determine any details. The audio says, “At this open house today there were many potential buyers who were foreign, mostly Chinese” (Global, “Mainland Chinese”). While it is possible that the reporter stayed at the open house all day to ask people their nationalities, it is more likely he made an assumption, or took the word of someone in the
real estate industry. The Canadian Association of Journalists ethics guidelines for reporters says, “We will not mislead the public by suggesting a reporter is some place that he or she isn’t” (qtd. in Russell). A combination of the use of a passive voice (“there were many potential buyers…” as opposed to “I saw,” or “Realtors say there were many potential buyers...”) with a visual shot that showed one thing and audio that said another, allows television journalists to show the story of an Asian invasion with only one substantiated Asian national. *Global News’s* “use of distortion, stereotyping, and over-representation of minority groups serves to heighten public anxieties and fears about immigrants and racialized groups” (Chiricos, Eschholz, and Gertz 1997; Dixon 2008 in W. Chan 8). The stark connection between intolerance and economics, manufactured by real estate marketers, is fostered by news media’s malpractices. The denial of the Canadianness of Chinese Canadian’s, is made that much easier by the medium of TV.

Repetitive messages combine to create a dominant frame that feeds the audience ideas of “common sense.” In order to get a closer look at the media frame on “Chinese” buyers in Vancouver, I used the online newspaper database, Canadian Newsstand, to seek articles from February 2012, a year before the above mentioned MAC Marketing scam, to the present date, December 7, 2014. I searched stories from the *Vancouver Sun* and *The Province*, which according to Newspapers Canada’s 2013 Daily Newspaper Circulation Report, are the two print media outlets with the largest distribution in the city (Newspapers Canada 4). Since the aim of the frame analysis is to seek stories regarding the representation of “Chinese” with respect to real estate, I searched using the terms “real estate,” “home,” “Chinese,” “foreign,” “Asian” and “buyer.” Each of the stories were assessed for a) the type of frame and b) the content. Every story except one was framed in a way that posed a problem and searched for a solution. In the following charts, any articles outside of the dominant frame are shaded grey.
In total, I analyzed twenty-one articles, seven in the year before the MAC Marketing scam and fourteen in the two years after. Six of the articles were found in *The Province*, and fifteen were found in the *Vancouver Sun*. The three articles in *The Province* before the scam, as listed in Table 4, showed the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pg</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Moral Judgement</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chinese investors targeting international city real estate</td>
<td>A39</td>
<td>growing # of Chinese buying overseas property</td>
<td>difficult to buy in China</td>
<td>It's their fault prices are increasing</td>
<td>(unstated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese keeping homes in check</td>
<td>A38</td>
<td>high prices/mkt chaos in China’s real estate market</td>
<td>speculative buying</td>
<td>free market is problematic</td>
<td>govt control of mkt keeps it in check</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feng shui for the market</td>
<td>A17</td>
<td>Developers should implement feng shui</td>
<td>feng shui attracts Asian buyers</td>
<td>Asians a priority in Van market</td>
<td>Developers should hire feng shui exporters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 - Frame Analysis showing Articles from *The Province* - Before the MAC Marketing Scam

In *The Province*’s coverage, both of the news stories followed a dominant frame where Chinese buyers are driving up the market, and even the “fluff piece” on feng shui sold the story that the real estate market is being set up to sell to “Asians.” Table 5 illustrates how The *Vancouver Sun*’s pre-scam coverage showed much more variation than *The Province*’s, and offered ideas outside of the dominant frame:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pg</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Moral Judgement</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inflation rate is anything but frozen</td>
<td>F7</td>
<td>Vancouver affordability will not improve</td>
<td>mainland Chinese among causes</td>
<td>To live in Van must pay a premium</td>
<td>Real estate still a good long term investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race is the unspoken issue</td>
<td>A4</td>
<td>Call for restrictions on offshore buyers</td>
<td>Blaming Chinese w/out evidence</td>
<td>Racial fault lines exist</td>
<td>Talk openly about issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nine ways to a fast sale</td>
<td>H4</td>
<td>Difficulty selling home</td>
<td>Market volatility</td>
<td>sellers not putting enough effort</td>
<td>various solutions; incl feng shui awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate and race: The New World hits home</td>
<td>A6</td>
<td>Responses to earlier article show racial resentment</td>
<td>mythologizing of Canada’s history</td>
<td>Global city requires adapting</td>
<td>Bigotry will halt creation of global city</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 - Frame Analysis showing Articles from the *Vancouver Sun* - Before the MAC Marketing Scam
These stories show a diversity of opinions, including one article discussing the pretention of multiculturalism and the reality of racial fault lines, and another article discussing the choice to open Vancouver as a global city as an alternate view to the frame set by marketers and “The Province.” The article, Nine ways to a fast sale, also stands out because despite being a marketing piece, it shows that at the same time that there are complaints of affordability due to Chinese buyers, they a) are not buying everything as suggested by the dominant frame, b) are not the only ones buying and selling houses at a profit and driving up prices as a result, and c) locals encourage Chinese buyers when there is personal profit to be had. The Province’s post-scam stories did not show any sign of increased criticalness or diversity in coverage as seen in Table 6:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pg</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Moral Judgement</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chinese tourist dollars are big attraction in B.C.</td>
<td>A10</td>
<td>Asian visitors “winning” at tourism spending in B.C.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanishing houses hold home truths</td>
<td>A10</td>
<td>Vanishing through rebuilding</td>
<td>Foreign buyers/developers upgrading</td>
<td>Vancouver should stay as is</td>
<td>City/residents should press issue</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 – Frame Analysis showing Articles from The Province – After the MAC Marketing Scam

Both articles in some way encourage the frame that foreign buyers are to blame. The first article is framed as a game rather than a problem and tells how Chinese tourists are “winning” by spending the most at B.C. tourism locations. The article mentions in a throwaway line, "Having reshaped the region’s real estate market and its universities, Asia is now transforming the face of Vancouver tourism." The assumption that “Asia,” is fully or solely responsible for the changes in Vancouver’s real estate market is taken as fact. The Vancouver Sun’s coverage of issues surrounding Chinese/foreign buyers increased after February 2013. Of the eleven articles in Table 7, three provided alternate voices that countered the dominant frame:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pg</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Moral Judgement</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreign ownership debate demands data;</td>
<td>C5</td>
<td>housing affordability crisis; no data</td>
<td>Most places record foreign ownership</td>
<td>Van residents losing out</td>
<td>data tracking necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many Hong Kong immigrants return home;</td>
<td>D7</td>
<td>Hong Kong residents leave with citizenship</td>
<td>Leave for jobs, family reunification</td>
<td>Potential expensive problem Cdn govt</td>
<td>Be wary of dual-citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple factors drive house prices; Real estate</td>
<td>A4</td>
<td>Immigrant investors among factors</td>
<td>Various people want to live in Vancouver</td>
<td>Economic, not immigration issue</td>
<td>(unstated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forum will discuss future of Vancouver real estate;</td>
<td>B8</td>
<td>Prices discourage CDNs from coming/staying</td>
<td>conference to explore solutions, restricting foreigners</td>
<td>locals will be forced to rent; enclave for wealthy foreigners</td>
<td>Look to conference findings, realtor opinion for insight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houses out of reach unless you inherit;</td>
<td>C4</td>
<td>affordability will not improve</td>
<td>Many reasons, including foreigners</td>
<td>Waiting is not an intelligent move</td>
<td>(unstated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of Vancouver real estate data</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>investors don’t build community</td>
<td>Residents losing out</td>
<td>foreign buyers cause stress locals</td>
<td>Crack down on foreign investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Global market’ sends real-estate soaring;</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>resentment, bitterness toward Chinese</td>
<td>Van now a global city</td>
<td>High prices new global reality</td>
<td>(unstated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American take on our real estate;</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>U.S. media surpised Van priciest NA market</td>
<td>Van a magnet for Chinese investors</td>
<td>Locals priced out; similar to U.S.</td>
<td>Unclear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate’s tax proposal targets foreign buyers;</td>
<td>C4</td>
<td>Empty homes and affordability a problem</td>
<td>investors buy homes, leave empty;</td>
<td>cause affordability problems</td>
<td>consider levy on foreign buyers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver real estate forecast to stay hot</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>red-hot market will not cool next year</td>
<td>Foreign money and robust economy.</td>
<td>Prices hard for locals</td>
<td>Require parental help, downsizing to buy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver housing prices tied to China’s</td>
<td>D3</td>
<td>No affordability in sight for Van real estate</td>
<td>rich foreigners drive up prices</td>
<td>Politicians fear blaming Chinese</td>
<td>(unstated)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 – Frame Analysis showing Articles from the *Vancouver Sun* – After the MAC Marketing Scam

From February 2013 the Vancouver Sun’s coverage of the issues surrounding Chinese and foreign buyers and price affordability increased significantly.
Considering the *Sun* was among the media duped by the MAC Marketing scam, it is curious that the paper did not explore the broader existence of marketing deception and examine it as a possible factor in rising real estate prices. Rather, most articles took the voice of the dominant frame. Three offered alternate ideas including that a) Vancouver residents are losing out because of affordability issues so data collection is required in order to know why, b) the factors driving up prices are economic not immigration-based, and c) in opening itself as a global city, the new reality is that Vancouver residents are competing on a global level. Throughout each set of articles, “Chinese” and “Asian” were both used interchangeably/ambiguously, in that they could be referring to Chinese nationality (foreigners) or Chinese ethnicity (possible Canadians).

Dominant frames can teach us what to believe about groups of people. The reiteration over months and years blaming “Chinese” for Vancouver real estate prices, ignores the complexity of factors that drive housing markets, including but not limited to marketing, economic circumstances, and government policies. The choice to lay blame for the state of Vancouver real estate market on “Chinese,” and by extension of ambiguity Chinese Canadians, affects audience perception of them, particularly when the language used is discriminatory and reinforces their Otherness and incompatibility with dominant group ways of life. A previous study has found that print journalists give voice to the resistance of dominant groups in society to accepting Asian immigrants by using word pairings like “monster homes” which creates the perception of being “ugly, frightful and ominous...a metaphor of the character of the people living in it, giving a concrete... dimension to the traditional orientalist image of the Chinese”” (*Sun* qtd. in Mahtani and Mountz). Not only is there a long established history of Othering Chinese Canadians with respect to the economy, their existence in Canada is problematized in other ways, such as the word choices
and “race-tagging” used with respect to crime reporting. When it comes to immigrants, news media use unfavourable and exclusionary word pairings like “Chinese gangster” to create a “problem immigrant” scenario, implying a network of crime with further problems to come (W. Chan 34-35). Beyond the word pairing, race-tagging effectively works to differentiate and other immigrant groups (Hier and Greenberg 499). The choice to identify

[t]heir racial otherness, made known through ongoing references to their nationality, bolsters the view that criminality is not just a characteristic of the individual, but it is also linked to the wider ethnic community to which the individual belongs. (41)

The sources selected for news stories and the soundbites used create narratives that cater to the perspective of the unhyphenated Canadian, reifying what they already know through “common sense.” Media representations have the power to shape the thoughts, feelings and actions of the public (Mahtani and Mountz 9), making it unequivocally important to compile a diversity of sources, cite materials as much as possible and fact-check what is being published. In the case of “Chinese” buyers driving up real estate in Vancouver, local media has established “Chinese” culpability as a dominant frame, inciting resentment towards Chinese Canadians, largely based on unsubstantiated information. News media tends to defer to the real estate industry and position them as subject matter experts despite their conflict of interest in shaping future buying patterns rather than describing past ones.

Journalists ask questions in order to make discoveries that they present to the public as information that is objective and accurate. Yet, how they ask questions changes the information received and the discoveries made. Table 8 assesses who The Province utilized as their sources in the stories analyzed above:
Three of the five primary sources cited were from the real estate industry, one was a feng shui consultant working for the real estate industry, and one was a woman concerned about Vancouver’s history disappearing. Only two articles cited a further source to corroborate the perspective of the first source, and no stories contrasted the source’s perspective in order to provide fruit for critical thinking or a diversity of views. With so few sources and so many of them real estate industry related, it is no surprise that all of these stories either told the story of the dominant frame, or accepted it as truth in passing. Most stories in the dominant frame focus on the product, real estate, and the economic victimization of locals because the “Chinese” are buying up the houses, implying a need for non-Chinese to stop being victims and act. The story, “Vanishing houses hold home truths” perceivably about architecture, brought the commodity image of white Canadian hegemony to the forefront:

> These are the houses that were first built on the land that used to be the wild,” said Adderson. They are more than just houses to her – they are “repositories of narratives, built layer by layer and made richer by the stories of the people who lived in them.”... it’s “not always about money.” Houses, for her, are “where your family is, where your family’s history is.” (Adderson qtd. in C. Chan, “Vanishing”; C. Chan, “Vanishing”)
Adderson makes an emotional appeal to keep Vancouver as it is by telling a selective history where the families, tribes, and histories of Canada’s First Nations are erased and Euro-Canadian families and histories are eternal, both in the past going back to “the wild” and in Adderson’s hope, in the future. *The Province*’s inability to offer diversity in views, encourage critical thinking, and find sources beyond professionals in the real estate industry or citizens who trumpet the same underlying story calls into question its integrity as a source of news for Canadians. Unlike *The Province*, the *Vancouver Sun* provided a diversity of sources in its coverage and, as demonstrated in Table 9, in some cases consulted with multiple sources to corroborate a story:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Real Estate</th>
<th>Economist/Analyst</th>
<th>Gov’t Body</th>
<th>Think Tank</th>
<th>Academic</th>
<th>Urban Planner</th>
<th>Other Media</th>
<th>Individual Named</th>
<th>Net Named</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inflation rate is anything but frozen;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race is the unspoken issue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nine ways to a fast sale;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate and race;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign ownership debate demands data;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many Hong Kong immigrants return home;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple factors drive house prices;</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forum will discuss future of Vancouver real estate;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houses out of reach unless you inherit;</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of Vancouver real estate data’s mind boggling.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global market sends real estate soaring;</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American take on our real estate;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate’s tax proposal targets foreign buyers;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver real estate forecast to stay hot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver housing prices tied to China’s economic...</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 – Source Assessment showing Articles Analyzed from the *Vancouver Sun*
The *Vancouver Sun* provided its readers with more diversity in frames, and in terms of sourcing, it looked well beyond the real estate industry, including other professionals such as urban planners, bank economists, and analysts, as well as engaging academics, government bodies, research groups, individuals and other media. However they kept up the dominant frame, re-establishing the idea of Chinese buyers bringing economic chaos to Vancouver with very little in terms of proof. The article, “Vancouver housing prices tied to China’s economic growth” stood out in the author’s desire to pinpoint Chinese buyers as the culprits. Journalist Barbara Yaffe quotes former Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation analyst, Robin Wiebe, whose “research of offshore influence on Vancouver's housing market between 1991 and 2013, finds "periods of faster growth in China coincide with growth in Vancouver's house prices," and “the volume of house sales and housing starts were also found to have a statistically significant relationship to GDP growth in China” (Yaffe, “Vancouver housing”). Yaffe corroborates Weibe’s correlation with David Ley, UBC Geography professor and author of the book Millionaire Migrants “which contained research demonstrating an exceptional correlation, from 1977 to 2002, between international immigration to Vancouver and the city's property prices” (Yaffe, “Vancouver housing”). While both Weibe and Ley’s work are a step up from the usual sources cited as proof for problematic Chinese buyers, even “a statistically significant relationship” and “an exceptional correlation” are not causation, and they are certainly not reason to believe that Chinese buyers are the only or even the main cause for rising real estate prices. Yaffe, however, believes she has found her long-awaited proof, “[t]he idea of Chinese buyers being in some way responsible for higher housing prices in the city is controversial. Vancouver's politicians and realtors, fearing a public backlash, have long been downplaying the notion. But the cat now appears to be well out of the bag” (Yaffe, “Vancouver housing”). After asking about the
culpability of Chinese buyers so many times, the *Vancouver Sun* reporter rushes to find the answer the paper has been seeking all along, even if only “in some way.”

Through blame, Othering, and problematization of Chinese Canadians in Vancouver news media, journalists still have not learned the difference between Chinese Canadians and Chinese, with little indication of wanting to change this practice. A study on the *Vancouver Sun* coverage of Chinese Canadians done by Creese and Peterson on five year periods in the early 1920’s and the late 1980’s found that “The *Vancouver Sun* presented highly selective, one-dimensional stereotypes of Chinese that formed a stock of local common-sense knowledge. In both the 1920’s and 1980’s Chinese Canadians were constructed as immigrants and foreigners who posed problems for larger society” (Creese and Peterson 122). Further, “although the term Chinese Canadian was common in public discourse in the 1980’s, even promoted through multiculturalism, the phrase rarely appeared in the pages of the *Vancouver Sun*” (123). For almost a century the *Vancouver Sun* has been resisting recognizing Chinese Canadians as Canadians, not to mention resisting accepting them as a part of the fabric of Canadian society. In fact in the 1980s, “[t]he *Vancouver Sun*, expected to speak to the entire population of the city, it did not do so... discourses framed news so as to produce a Chinese Other; an object, not a subject, of news reporting” (124). This is still the case for the most part for the *Sun* and also true for *The Province*. The articles analyzed created a dichotomy between Chinese and locals, squeezing out the possibility of an in-between. The dichotomy has the “Chinese” as outsiders and perpetual objects of discussion, always in relation to the subject of the local. Cleese and Peterson report that:
Common sense images of the Chinese Other coexisted uneasily with multicultural discourses challenging definitions of an imagined white community. However, multicultural discourses were harnessed largely to boost Asian capital, reinforcing the image of Chinese Canadians with wealth. This meant that Chinese capital could be assigned responsibility for the dislocation of economic restructuring, thereby fuelling anti-Chinese racism. (125)

Thus, not only is it possible for intolerance to inspire economics, in the case of media representations of Chinese Canadians on the West coast, it has been an ongoing trend.

**Conclusion**

Canadians who grew up with multicultural values have adapted their mindsets and practices from previous generations by recognizing Canadians of Chinese descent as Chinese Canadians. In theory, the recognition of dual identities represented an acceptance of various ethnicities as a part of the diversity of Canadian society. The experience of Chinese Canadians on the West coast shows that without the promotion of understanding and acceptance of Chinese Canadians as a part of the diversity of Canadian society, recognizing ethnicity only serves to distance, Other, and exclude. Despite its potential for misrepresentation and its use in media manipulation, the multicultural dual identity is not going anywhere any time soon. Not only is the practice of ascribing hyphenated identities to visible minorities engrained in the Canadian consciousness, in the case of Canadians of Chinese descent, 55 percent self-identify through a hyphenated identity (Belanger and Verkuyten 149).

So long as the dual identity exists, there will be those who take advantage of it. In some cases it is individuals who wish for a Canada of their liking, where they do not have to accommodate and include those who they feel are not or cannot be truly Canadian. The subtlety, denial, and fluctuation
of this race-based exclusion makes it hard to identify, not to mention address. Yet for some scholars, this form of racism is not in spite of multiculturalism, but because of it: the “[e]mergence of a subliminal racism should come as little surprise in a multicultural society that prefers its racism to be polite” (Fleras 438). Among those who would manipulate the divide between Canadians and hyphenated Canadians are marketers who commodify the yearning for a time before multiculturalism when the composition of Canadian society felt more comfortable to them. In creating a commodity image for Vancouver real estate, marketers have shown they know and understand the Canadian consciousness “so well the product fits him and sells itself” (qtd. in Kotler.) They are only able to take advantage of this desire because it already exists within Canadians.

The belief in “our” society, “our” culture, “our” land is perpetuated by narratives shaped by news media whose gaze is that of the “Canadian,” and speaks of the hyphenated Canadian as an object to be accepted or rejected. News media narratives teach a “common sense” that is only common to the dominant group. The cost of believing in news media objectivity is power and control: “the groups at the top of the power structure gain the material advantages of power and control while the groups at the bottom trade real power for psychological reassurances (Bennett 269). Studies suggest that education at the citizen level can shift the imbalance of power created by believing in the myth of an objective news media (260). Encouraging citizen engagement can result in turning “passive consumers into active producers of public information” (261). Until Canadian culture encourages education about public issues beyond news media, marketer’s power to manipulate Canadians and profit from intolerance will continue.
Works Cited


88


**Primary Sources Analysed**

*Real Estate Marketing:*


News Media:


Jurock, Ozzie. “Inflation rate is anything but frozen; Whether it’s the cost of an ice cream cone or real estate in Greater Vancouver, the proof is in the pricing.” *Vancouver Sun.* 17 Feb 2012: F.7. Web. 7 Dec. 2012

Jurock, Ozzie. “Nine ways to a fast sale; A good marketing effort will help ensure your home attracts buyers even in a slow economy.” *Vancouver Sun.* 06 Apr 2012: H.4. Web. 7 Dec. 2012


Todd, Douglas. “Foreign ownership debate demands data; Real estate forum brings issues about Vancouver's future into sharp focus, but no one seems to have the necessary information.” *Vancouver Sun.* 23 Mar 2013: C.5. Web. 7 Dec. 2012


Découverte de l’étranger en nous-mêmes – Tension entre l’Être masculin et l’Autre féminin dans, L’enfant de sable, de Tahar Ben Jelloun

Par JULIE MONGEON

RÉSUMÉ : Lorsque l’on pense à l’Autre il est généralement question d’autrui. Mais que se produit-il lorsque l’on découvre que l’Autre est non seulement à l’extérieur de notre propre personne mais est simultanément en nous-mêmes? Cette lente et pénible réalisation est justement ce qui se produit chez le personnage d’Ahmed dans le roman L’enfant de sable, de Tahar Ben Jelloun. Le concept de Julia Kristeva dans son ouvrage Étrangers à nous-mêmes, sert de ligne directrice dans cette étude pour éclairer les phénomènes de dédoublements internes et externes qui perturbent le personnage d’Ahmed tout au long de sa vie. L’histoire se passe dans la société patriarcale marocaine où Ahmed apprend à refouler son Être intérieur (et extérieur) féminin.

MOTS-CLES : Étranger en nous-mêmes, Autre, Julia Kristeva, inquiétante étrangeté

ABSTRACT: When we think of Other we usually think of people outside of ourselves. What happens when we find out that the Other is not only outside of ourselves but simultaneously inside all of us? This slow and painful realisation is exactly what happens to Ahmed, the main character in the novel, L’enfant de sable by Tahar Ben Jelloun. The concept of the internal stranger found in Julia Kristeva’s work Étrangers à nous-mêmes, is used as a guide to answer questions about the internal and external doubling phenomena that troubles Ahmed throughout his life. The story takes place in a patriarchal Moroccan society where Ahmed is taught to reject his inner (and exterior) woman.

KEY WORDS: Stranger within, Other, Julia Kristeva, uncanny

---

comment se manifeste la tension entre le refoulement et l'acceptation de l'étranger en nous-mêmes représenté chez le personnage d'Ahmed, dans *L'enfant de sable*. Cette tension entre le refoulement et l'acceptation passe par la formation de l'Être masculin, par les manifestations de « l’inquiétante étrangeté » et par les différents recours symboliques du roman.

1. **Formation de l’Être masculin**

   Cette tension se manifeste dans un premier temps par une formation de l’Être masculin qui rejette d’emblée l’Être féminin ce qui réduit celui-ci au statut d’étranger intérieur refoulé (aussi appelé dans cette étude l’Autre féminin). Cette attitude négative vis-à-vis du sexe féminin naît de la société patriarcale dans lequel se déroule le récit. En effet, « [l]e contexte socioculturel modèle l’esprit des protagonistes. Les croyances et les tabous, la rumeur et la peur du qu’en-dira-t-on se font sentir » (Hauptman 15). L’histoire se passe au Maroc, à Marrakech, dans une société fortement patriarcale où l’homme est perçu comme étant « un être naturellement supérieur à la femme [selon] : la religion, le texte coranique, la société, la tradition, la famille, le pays » (*ES* 152), bref presque tous les éléments qui la composent.

   a. **Formation par le Père**

   C’est dans ce cadre sociale que débute l’histoire centrale du roman. Hadj Ahmed est père de sept filles. Il croit être maudit par un sortilège qui l’empêcherait d’avoir un fils – donc un héritier légitime. Il décide que leur huitième enfant sera un garçon même s’il naît fille. Il fait un pacte de silence avec sa femme et décide ainsi du destin de son enfant. À la naissance de son huitième enfant « il avait déjà oublié [...] qu’il avait tout arrangé. Il avait
bien vu que c’était une fille, mais croyait fermement que c’était un garçon » (ES 27). Ainsi est né le personnage principal, Ahmed. Suivant son plan, le père élève l’enfant comme un garçon dans le secret absolu. L’attitude du père vis-à-vis des femmes est très révélatrice des valeurs sociétales patriarcales qu’il a ingérées et qu’il inculquera à son fils.

Le père joue un rôle primordial dans la formation de l’Être masculin du personnage d’Ahmed. Effectivement, son attitude envers les femmes sera transmise à son fils et aura une grande influence sur le développement de l’Être masculin du protagoniste. Dans le récit, il est évident que le père a refoulé son Être féminin intérieur à un tel point que ce rejet est projeté sur les femmes qui le côtoient et qui deviennent, sous son regard, Autres. Son refoulement de la femme est symbolisé par une « muraille épaisse » (ES 18) qu’il a dressé en lui, mais aussi dans ses relations avec ses sept filles. Il les renie complètement en faisant « tout pour les oublier, pour les chasser de sa vue. Par exemple, il ne les nommait jamais » (ES 17). La mère, par ailleurs, devient la complice du père dans la transmission des valeurs patriarcales. Son silence devient le pacte du consentement. Ainsi, le père élève Ahmed avec une main de fer. Lorsqu’Ahmed laisse entrevoir une faiblesse « féminine » le père le corrige sévèrement et corporellement : « Tout se passait comme le père l’avait prévu et espéré. Ahmed grandissait selon la loi du père qui se chargeait personnellement de son éducation » (ES 32). Ainsi, dans le récit, Ahmed « éprouve la magie du regard qui le métamorphose » (de Beauvoir, cité dans Dantier 8), plus précisément, la magie du regard de son père qui fait de lui un Être masculin à part entière. C’est effectivement un exemple formidable de la construction sociale du genre comme l’entend Simone de Beauvoir.
b. **Hammam**

Suivant une éducation marocaine traditionnelle, les parents d’Ahmed l’amènent au Hammam. Petit garçon il accompagne sa mère dans ce lieu qui sera pour lui « une découverte étrange et amère » (*ES* 32). C’est dans ce lieu qu’il aura sa première confrontation avec l’étranger en lui – son Autre féminin. Effectivement, c’est là qu’il entrevoit pour la première fois le sexe féminin qu’il décrit comme n’étant « pas beau » et « même dégoutant » (*ES* 36). Ces sexes viennent le hanter dans son sommeil. Il les voit dans ses rêves et dit: « Je les battais car je savais que je ne serais jamais comme elles ; je ne pouvais pas être comme elles... C’était pour moi une dégénérescence inadmissible » (*ES* 36). Bien qu’il rejette violemment le sexe féminin, cela n’empêche qu’il est prit d’un doute qui l’inquiète dès un très jeune âge. Cette première manifestation de l’inquiétante étrangeté chez le jeune personnage l’alarme et il commence à observer son corps avec attention. Il est intéressant de noter que c’est dans ce lieu de « brouillard tiède » (*ES* 33), où la vapeur reste en suspens dans l’air et rend la vue difficile, qu’Ahmed ressent sa première expérience ambiguë avec l’Autre féminin qui lui donne la sensation d’être « brumeux » (Kristeva 276). Lorsqu’Ahmed atteint un certain âge, il n’est plus admis au hammam avec les femmes et doit dorénavant aller avec son père dans « le brouillard masculin » (*ES* 37).

c. **Refoulement initial de la part d’Ahmed**

Chez le personnage d’Ahmed, c’est durant la période adolescente que « le moi se spécifie peu à peu une instance particulière qui peut s’opposer au reste du moi, qui sert à l’observation de soi et à l’autocritique, qui accomplit le travail de la censure psychique » (Freud 237). Effectivement, en pleine croissance d’adolescence, le corps d’Ahmed le trahit.
et c’est alors qu’il prend conscience de son dédoublement identitaire et dit :
« je suis [...] moi et un autre ; moi et une autre » (ES 46).

De plus, l’expérience traumatisante de ses premières menstruations se
traduit en lui comme une décision mentale et consciente de la nécessité d’un
refoulement complet et absolu de tout ce qui, en lui, relève du féminin. Lors
d’une discussion avec son père, Ahmed exprime sa décision d’être un homme
à part. Il associe la condition féminine de « souffrance, [...] malheur et [...] solitude » (ES 51). Notons ici que la solitude, le silence et l’obscurité (sociale)
sont tous des caractéristiques qui définissent l’univers des femmes du
roman. Les sœurs sont toujours décrites comme étant silencieuses et la mère
s’enferme dans une solitude complète jusqu’à sa mort. Ces trois éléments
sont décrits par Freud comme étant des « angoisses infantiles qui ne
s’éteignent jamais tout à fait » (Freud 263). Cette explication psychologique
vient enrichir notre compréhension du choix d’Ahmed. C’est en partie parce
qu’il est encore habité par ces peurs infantiles qu’il désire s’éloigner le plus
possible de son Autre féminin.

Cette période de sa vie peut être interprétée, selon Kristeva, comme un
refoulement « des processus et des contenus représentatifs qui ne sont plus
nécessaires au plaisir, à l’autoconservation et à la croissance adaptative du
sujet parlant » (Kristeva 272-273, je souligne). L’autoconservation de
l’identité masculine, comme l’envisage son père, exige un rejet total du corps
biologique féminin. Ce rejet du corps aura des résultats négatifs sur le
personnage d’Ahmed. Le narrateur-conteur, Si Abdel Malek, le décrit ainsi :
« il était devenu un monstre. Son comportement depuis une année l’avait
transformé et rendu méconnaissable. Il était devenu destructeur et violent,
en tout cas étrange » (ES 52). Il y a un lien corrélatif entre son
comportement négatif et son rejet de l’Autre intérieur. Durant son
adolescence, Ahmed « devient autoritaire » (ES 51) et maltraite ses sœurs
qui ne savent rien de sa réelle condition et subissent en silence les traitements de leur frère cadet.

2. **Manifestation de l’inquiétante étrangeté**

Selon Freud, « [s]erait unheimlich tout ce qui devait rester un secret, dans l’ombre, et qui en est sorti » (Freud 222), ainsi le secret autour de l’Être féminin d’Ahmed (devenu l’Autre féminin à force de le refouler) sera la cause de son inquiétante étrangeté qui refait surface et trouble le personnage. Ainsi selon Kristeva, certaines circonstances « rendent propice cette traversée du refoulement [qui engendrent] l’inquiétante étrangeté » (Kristeva 273). En effet, elle emprunte les divers éléments de la liste présentée par Freud et les réduits à trois; soit la mort, le sexe féminin et les pulsions immaîtrisables. Malgré les efforts conscients d’Ahmed de refouler l’étranger féminin en lui, il n’échappe guère à ces manifestations d’inquiétante étrangeté qui éveillent en lui un sentiment d’angoisse.

a. **Mort**

Pour ce qui est du domaine de la mort, selon Freud, « [c]e qui paraît le plus haut point étrangement inquiétant à beaucoup de personnes est ce qui se rattache à la mort, aux cadavres et au retour des morts, aux esprits et aux fantômes » (Freud 246). Ceci viendrait du fait que nous refusons la mort. La nuit, Ahmed ressent cette inquiétante étrangeté lorsqu’il pense à la mort. C’est en y pensant longuement qu’il prend la résolution de faire « de la souffrance un palais où la mort n’aura pas de place » (ES 57). Ahmed rejette la mort et se convainc qu’il l’a repoussé par le biais de la souffrance. Il dit : « Ce corps est fait de fibres qui accumulent la douleur et intimident la mort. C’est cela ma liberté » (ES 57). Pourtant cela n’empêche pas qu’elle crée en lui une angoisse qui le hante toute la nuit et lorsqu’elle se retire « [il] reste seul à [se] battre jusqu’à l’aube » (ES 57).

b. Sexe féminin

La seconde circonstance décrite par Kristeva est le contact avec le sexe féminin. Freud dit qu’« [i]l advient souvent que des hommes névrosés déclarent que le sexe féminin est pour eux quelque chose d’étrangement inquiétant » (Freud 252). Nous savons à présent que l’éducation d’Ahmed s’est faite dans un rejet total de son Autre féminin et qu’il grandit dans un monde masculin à l’écart des femmes. Sa vie se résumait à ceci : « Ahmed ne
quittait jamais son père. Son éducation s’est faite en dehors de la maison et loin des femmes » (ES 42), ainsi son contact avec les femmes était très limité. Jusqu’au jour où il épousa Fatima, sa cousine qui souffrait d’épilepsie et boitait d’une jambe.

Dès le premier jour de leur mariage, l’inquiétante étrangeté s’immisce en lui. Il doute de lui-même et de son apparence physique. En effet, « [I]a présence de Fatima [I]e troublait beaucoup. » (ES 77). Ahmed se permet de l’observer longuement et voit en elle quelque chose de familier et d’inquiétant. Il dit : « [...] cette femme m’empêchait de dormir. Il m’arrivait de l’observer longtemps dans son sommeil, la regardant fixement jusqu’à perdre les traits et le contour de son visage et pénétrer dans ses pensées profondes, enfouis dans un puits de ténèbres » (ES 77). En observant Fatima longuement, le contour du visage de son épouse perdent leurs traits définitifs qui font d’elle un individu à part pour devenir, en quelque sorte, le miroir de l’étranger en lui. En effet, ce contact éveille en lui des doutes obsédants qui le perturbent. Ahmed croit être capable d’entrer dans les pensées de Fatima. Il dit, par exemple : « Je délirais en silence, réussissant à joindre ses pensées et même à les reconnaître comme si elles avaient été émises par moi. C’était là mon miroir, ma hantise et ma faiblesse » (ES 77). Incapable de saisir Fatima complètement, et du coup, saisir son étranger intérieur, Ahmed se perd de plus en plus, il dit : « je regardais avec un sentiment où la pitié, la tendresse et la colère étaient mêlées dans un tourbillon où je perdais le sens et la patience des choses, où je devenais de plus en plus étranger à mon destin et à mes projets » (ES 78). Fatima reflète son double intérieur, comme Freud le dit : « Le double est devenu une image d’épouvante » (Freud 239), ceci est définitivement le cas chez Ahmed qui, par peur, décide de se débarrasser de son épouse. L’inquiétante étrangeté qu’elle éveil en lui est insoutenable. Il l’a repoussé loin de lui, loin de sa vue : « je voulais me débarrasser de Fatima sans lui faire de mal. Je l’installais
dans une chambre éloignée de la mienne et me mis lentement à la haïr. Je venais d’échouer dans le processus que j’avais préparé et déclenché » (ES 79). Cependant, éloigner Fatima n’était pas suffisant pour Ahmed. En effet, même avec cette distance physique il ressentait toujours l’inquiétante étrangeté. C’est alors qu’il désire non seulement étouffer son Autre féminin mais plutôt l’éliminer complètement. Ceci est reflété dans sa relation avec Fatima où il va jusqu’à désirer sa mort, il dit: « Je désirais sa mort. Je lui en voulais d’être infirme, d’être femme, et d’être la, par ma volonté, ma méchanceté, mon calcul et la haine de moi-même » (ES 80). Kristeva dit : « Face à l’étranger que je refuse et auquel je m’identifie à la fois, je perds mes limites, je n’ai plus de contenant » (Kristeva 276), cette citation décrit parfaitement la situation d’Ahmed qui perd complètement ses moyens autour de Fatima. La mort de son épouse symboliserait sa propre mort en tant que femme.

c. **Pulsions immaîtrisables**


Des pulsions sexuelles, qualifiables de pulsions immaîtrisables – « pulsion[s] elle-même[s], à la charnière de la psyché et de la biologie, qui déborde de freinage imposé par l’homéostasie organique » (Kristeva 274) – sont observables chez Ahmed et ont un effet chez lui très troublant. En effet, ses pulsions sexuelles longtemps refoulées font surface et créent chez lui ce sentiment d’inquiétante étrangeté. Ses pulsions l’effraient et le dégoûtent. Elles éveillent en lui un souvenir refoulé de son enfance où il avait entrevu ses parents dans leur lit conjugal. Cette scène traumatisante pour le jeune enfant refait surface sous forme d’inquiétante étrangeté à l’âge adulte. Bien qu’il étouffe ses pulsions sexuelles depuis longtemps, peu à peu il se laisse aller sur ce chemin inquiétant. C’est au travers de ses pulsions sexuelles incontrôlables qu’il entrevoit de plus en plus l’étranger en lui – la femme en lui. « Nous sommes tous victimes de notre folie enfouie dans les tranchées du désir qu’il ne faut surtout pas nommer » (ES 27).

3. **Symbolisme**

Les symboles du roman qui se trouvent à la fois dans son contenu et dans sa structure narrative confirment un pacte de lecture qui suggère une quête sur le chemin qui accèderait au Moi intérieur. En effet, « le signe n’est pas vécu comme arbitraire, mais prend une importance réelle » (Kristeva 275) et c’est ainsi que nous devrions envisager les symboles dans l’œuvre.
a. **Le désert**

Entre autres, l'image récurrente d’une traversée du désert symbolise une traversée pénible qui laisse difficilement entrevoir l’oasis où toutes les réponses sur le Moi intérieur seraient dévoilées. En effet, l’étendue désertique est « par excellence l’espace du silence » (Novén 52), donc l’espace pénible que l’on traverse mais qui ne nous donne pas de réponses. Ahmed lui-même fait référence à cette image. Durant la période où il tente de se confirmer en tant qu’homme et de renier complètement son Autre féminin il dit: « Depuis que je me suis retiré dans cette chambre je ne cesse d’avancer sur les sables d’un désert où je ne vois pas d’issue » (ES 88). C’est en sortant de sa maison, en découvrant son Autre féminin qu’« Ahmed met un terme à la marche désertique » (Novén 53). Cependant, la narration continuera de faire allusion à ce désert dans lequel l’œuvre ne sort jamais réellement, suggérant l’impossibilité d’accéder véritablement à l’étranger intérieur – l’Autre féminin.

b. **L’architecture**

La structure du roman ainsi que certaines images renvoient à un symbolisme de l’architecture que Novén définit comme « [l’]édifice textuel » (Novén 147). Le conteur, en charge de raconter l’histoire d’Ahmed, indique au lecteur que le récit passera par sept portes, chacune d’elles correspond à un chapitre. Ainsi, le narrateur utilise l’image de la porte pour désigner l’algorithme du récit, chaque séquence apportant une résolution partielle de l’intrigue qui permet au lecteur d’accéder à la suivante et de franchir, étape par étape, l’espace cadastré de l’intrigue. (Gontard 15)

Le conteur, Si Abdel Malek, indique que la narration passera par ces portes et que pour accéder à la vérité – donc l’étranger intérieur – il faut posséder
les clés pour les ouvrir. Il déclare ceci : « En vérité, vous les possédez les clés mais vous ne le savez pas ; et, même si vous le saviez, vous ne sauriez les tourner et encore moins sous quelle pierre tombale les enterrer » (ES 13). Ainsi, cela signifie que tout le monde a accès à l'étranger en nous-mêmes, mais que nous ne savons pas comment l'atteindre. Le conteur promet de montrer la route et pour y arriver il faut passer par les sept portes et les ouvrir une à une.

Pourtant, comme le souligne Gontard, au fur et à mesure que l'on progresse par chapitre – et que le personnage d'Ahmed se rapproche de plus en plus de son Autre féminin – la description des portes indique une dégradation. En effet, la première porte « Porte du jeudi », où commence l'histoire d'Ahmed, est décrite comme étant « majestueuse », « superbe », « lourde et belle » (ES 16). Plus, l'on se rapproche de l'Autre féminin en passant par les portes, plus la description de celles-ci se dégrade. Effectivement, la dernière porte, « La porte emmurée » (ES 73), indique, par son titre, une porte inaccessible. Ce chapitre correspond à celui où Ahmed, maintenant marié avec Fatima, est profondément troublé par sa présence et entrevoit plus clairement qu'auparavant son Autre féminin. De plus, dans le roman l’Autre féminin réside symboliquement dans une maison en ruine à l'intérieur de nous-mêmes. Effectivement, c'est dans ce chapitre qu'Ahmed s'imagine entendre des pas sur un vieux plancher qui craque lorsqu'il semble rêver qu'il accède aux pensées de Fatima. En fait, le narrateur garde une ambiguïté ici à savoir s'il s'agit de l'imagination, d'un rêve ou de quelque chose d'autre. Comme le souligne Kristeva, « l'inquiétante étrangeté se produit lorsque s'effacent les “limites entre imagination et réalité” » (278). Ceci est définitivement le cas dans cette scène. Le vieux plancher le mène vers « une maison en ruine, abandonnée […] au toit plein de trous » qui le conduit vers une « cave, véritable grotte préhistorique, [où] gisaient les pensées » (ES 78) de Fatima (qui comme nous l'avons vu est le miroir de son
Autre féminin). Donc, l’Autre féminin réside à l’intérieur de l’Être masculin dans une maison en ruine – en ruine parce que démoli par le refoulement constant qui le réduit à un être dévasté. La maison même où demeure Ahmed à Marrakech tombe de plus en plus en ruine lorsque le protagoniste explore de plus en plus son côté féminin. De ce fait, les références aux maisons en ruines qui correspondaient à la demeure délabrée de l’Autre féminin sont récurrentes dans l’œuvre.

Pour ce qui est des portes qui se dégradent, la dernière porte ne correspond pas à la septième porte que promettait le conteur au début du récit. En effet, « le récit va sortir des portes qui jusqu’à présent le cadastreraient pour devenir un récit labyrinthique, un récit impossible » (Gontard 16). En effet, comme l’indique le narrateur, le récit se situe à un moment dans une cour, une « place ronde, et de ce cercle partiront autant de rues que de nuits » (ES 109) d’où il serait difficile, voir impossible, de sortir. Ainsi, le narrateur souligne que ce parcours irréalisable et labyrinthique nous empêche d’accéder véritablement à l’étranger intérieur – l’Autre féminin.

c. Écritures : Épistolaire & autobiographique

La narration du récit passe pas diverses formes. Entre autres, il y a la narration de l’histoire d’Ahmed par l’entremise du conteur Si Abdel Malek. Ainsi qu’une narration de style épistolaire lors de la correspondance entre Ahmed et son correspondant anonyme. Cette communication entre Ahmed et cette personne mystérieuse symbolise une communication entre l’Être et l’Autre.

Lorsqu’il est question du correspondant anonyme et de son identité, plusieurs interprétations sont possibles. En effet, son identité demeure ambiguë tout au long du récit. Il est possible d’envisager le

s’il est si dispersé? » (53). En effet, « [c]e livre comme objet narratif ressortit à une série à variables multiples qui manifeste l’indécidabilité textuelle » (50), ce qui laisse le lecteur dans une perpétuelle ambiguïté sans jamais donner de réponses. Le fait que le livre tombe en morceau, au fur et à mesure que l’histoire avance, souligne encore une fois cette impossibilité d’accéder véritablement et pleinement à l’Autre féminin. Tout de même, l’action même de le lire et d’essayer de le comprendre signifie une volonté de faire un retour sur soi-même pour communiquer, ou du moins apprendre à connaître, l’étranger en soi.

d. Le corps

L’autre symbole récurrent de l’œuvre est celui du corps qui subit physiquement les traces de la lutte entre le refoulement ou l’acceptation de l’Autre féminin. Lorsqu’Ahmed est résolu à refouler complètement son Autre féminin pour embrasser complètement son Être masculin, son corps répond à sa demande et subit les changements physiques en conséquence. En effet, lorsqu’il décide d’être un homme à part entière, il décrit ses changements corporels comme suit :

As-tu vu mon corps? il a grandi ; il a réintégré sa propre demeure..., je me suis débarrassé de l’autre écorce ; elle était fragile et transparente. J’ai plâtré la peau. Le corps a grandi et je ne dors plus dans le corps d’un autre. (ES 53)

Même que sa voix prend des sonorités masculines et sa barbe commence à pousser.

De la même manière que lorsqu’il embrasse son côté féminin ses traits physiques commencent à changer. Cela dit, il ne réussit pas à ressembler à une véritable femme. En effet, il est décrit comme étant une femme à barbe avec peu de seins. Incapable d’être physiquement une femme
à part entière renforce encore une fois l’idée de l’impossibilité d’accéder pleinement à son Autre féminin intérieur.

De plus, le correspondant anonyme (considéré dans cette étude comme étant l’Autre féminin d’Ahmed) décrit son but comme étant « un acharnement à rendre à votre visage l’image et les traits de l’origine » (ES 91). Ceci sous-entend qu’un changement physique concrétiserait symboliquement et physiquement l’acceptation complète de l’Autre féminin. Ceci est d’autant plus significatif lorsqu’Ahmed dit qu’« il va falloir retourner à l’enfance, être petite fille » (ES 98). En effet, pour pouvoir véritablement accéder à son Autre féminin il doit physiquement retourner là où le refoulement a commencé – la petite enfance.

Ce qui renforce davantage l’idée de cette impossibilité d’accès à l’Autre féminin est le fait que durant cette lutte entre son refoulement et son acceptation, le corps d’Ahmed s’est rapidement dégradé au point où il fut un vieillard à un très jeune âge et connu une mort prématurée. Ainsi, le corps porte physiquement les blessures causées par cette difficile communication entre l’Être et l’Autre en soi. En effet, Ahmed « ne réussit jamais à être deux, et, pourtant, il poursuit la quête de son unité, sans parvenir davantage à l’individualiser; c’est pourquoi il s’abîme » (Quintiliano 155). La mort prématurée du personnage souligne encore une fois l’impossibilité d’accéder véritablement à l’étranger intérieur.

En somme, la tension entre le refoulement et l’acceptation de l’Autre féminin chez le personnage d’Ahmed soulève plus de questions que de réponses. Tout de même, il est évident que la formation de l’Être masculin – celui qui grandit dans une société patriarcale qui rejette fortement la femme et la réduit au statut de l’Autre – aura de grandes
difficultés à se défaire des valeurs que lui a inculquées sa société pour observer son Autre féminin sous une lumière positive et égalitaire. De plus, « l’inquiétante étrangeté » se manifeste par la mort, le sexe féminin et les pulsions immaîtrisables qui hantent le personnage d’Ahmed tout au long de sa vie. Ces manifestations laissent entrevoir l’Autre féminin refoulé. Aussi, il semblerait que le personnage d’Ahmed est

condamné à une éternelle recherche d’identité, mais sa démarche s’avère inopérante car, en détruisant son double pour s’individualiser, il anéantit l’Autre de lui-même, comme un être qui pour détruire son ombre doit également se détruire ». (Quintiliano 159)

Ainsi, nous pouvons observer les effets négatifs qui résultent d’une tentative d’éliminer complètement, soit le côté féminin, ou le côté masculin qui cohabitent en nous. De cette façon, l’oeuvre suggère d’essayer d’atteindre un certain équilibre entre les deux : « Dans la vie on devrait pouvoir porter deux visages » (ES 162). Cette requête nous est présentée comme un but impossible à atteindre parfaitement mais auquel nous devrions tout de même miser notre effort. En effet, ce « mythe utopique de la complétude » (Quintiliano 159) est présenté comme étant impossible car la société patriarcale ne le permet pas. Cela dit, l’oeuvre souligne l’importance de faire un retour sur soi pour mieux connaître son Être ainsi que son Autre. Ainsi, pourrions-nous mieux nous connaître nous-mêmes pour mieux connaître et traiter autrui.
Ouvrages cités


Kapuściński’s Representation of the Other: A Complex Dialogue between Theory and Practice

By JUSTINE DRAUS

RéSUMÉ : Cet article examine les différentes techniques appliquées par Ryszard Kapuściński, feu journaliste de voyage polonais, lorsqu’il parle de « l’Autre ». Bien que Kapuściński ait travaillé comme reporteur, cet article suit la déclaration récurrente de plusieurs critiques selon laquelle ses œuvres peuvent rentrer dans le cadre des récits de voyages. L’article explore comment l’auteur donne une voix aux Autres, les présente comme des sujets distincts, au lieu d’un « Autre » généralisé et utilise un narrateur peu digne de confiance (‘unreliable narrator’). En fin de compte, l’article conclu que la culmination de ces techniques présente un dialogue entre Kapuściński et son Autre, montrant sa capacité à discuter ses expériences avec « l’Autre » sans le désigner l’Autre dans une position de subalterne, mais en lui donnant une subjectivité.

MOTS-CLEFS : Écriture de voyage, reportage littéraire, Kapuściński, orientalisme, communication stratégique

ABSTRACT: This article examines different techniques used by the late Polish travel journalist Ryszard Kapuściński when talking about “The Other.” Although Kapuściński was employed as a reporter, this paper follows the persistent claim from various critics that his works also fall under the genre of travel writing. It explores how he gives voice to Others, presents Others as distinct subjects rather than a generalized “Other,” and often uses an unreliable narrator; ultimately arguing that the culmination of these techniques results in a dialogue between Kapuściński and his Other, and demonstrates his ability to discuss experiences with “the Other” without designating the Other to a position of sub-alternity, but rather by giving subjectivity to the Other.

KEY WORDS: Travel writing, literary reportage, Kapuściński, orientalism, communication strategies
Ryszard Kapuściński is in a unique position when it comes to travel writing.\(^1\) The history of travel writing contains many accounts of “interested individuals” who were “men of their time” (Bailey-Goldschmidt 143).\(^2\) Those with enough wealth, fortune and status to travel beyond the borders of their country, became “architects of imperial visions, the exoticisers, commodifiers, and objectifiers of colonised “others” who helped their readers (often people in imperial ‘mother countries’) to understand, accept, and consume the exercise of empire” (Wrobel, David; qtd. in Kalman 516). Kapuściński, however, did not come from such noble origins, did not belong to an imperial power, nor did he express any interest in economic gain. His travels did not stem from a desire to either discover or conquer new lands, but from expressing his modest desire of “crossing the border.” This desire would later propel his editor in chief to send him to India as part of newly developing relationships between India and Poland, in an attempt to “bring that distant land closer” (Kapuściński, Travels with Herodotus 10). His career spanned across six decades, between 1955-2007, and despite many obstacles, such as the temporary confiscation of his Polish passport by the government (Tighe 211), or the dwindling popularity of the genre of travel writing attributed to the rise of travel in the twenty-first century (Thomson 30), his works have been granted notoriety and many have been translated into multiple languages.

This paper will focus on what Kapuściński had to say about his Other, both directly, and indirectly: how the Other is presented in his works and also how the Other is represented. Kapuściński seeks to treat Others not as objects of study, but as subjects of study. The term ‘subjects’ is used

\(^1\) Kapuściński often describes his own work as ‘literary reportage’ and not under the category of ‘travel writing’ or ‘travel literature’, as others have described it.

\(^2\) Although the genre of travel literature - especially that of the most popular era during the fifteenth, sixteenth and seventeenth centuries - was dominated by men, there are also examples of contributions to this literary style by women. See for example The Turkish Embassy Letters by Lady Mary Wortley Montagu.
because Kapuściński attempts to have Others participate in a dialogue with him, rather than to merely report on his observations of Others during his travels. He presents many encounters with the Other in his literary works, but he also allows Others to represent themselves and their own stories within these texts. This follows his main thesis that communication is critical in encounters with Others. While this thesis is underlined most clearly in his lectures, he displays this theme throughout his literary works as well. This paper will provide a close look at three novels by Ryszard Kapuściński: The Other, a collection of lectures Kapuściński gave on the topic of ‘The Other’ and ‘Otherness;’ Travels with Herodotus, an autobiographical account of Kapuściński’s early works as a travelling journalist entwined with the reports of Greek historian and writer Herodotus; and The Emperor, a reportage of the rule, decline, and dispersion of Haile Selassie’s regime, composed of various accounts by members of the court.3 Through the analysis of these three texts it will become clear that through Kapuściński’s methods of giving voice to Others, displaying the diversity amongst Others, and creating the stance of an ‘unreliable narrator,’4 he attempts to follow his theme of communication and enter into a dialogue with his ‘Others.’ However, despite his conscious attempts to write about his Other(s) through dialogue without ‘othering’ (estranging them, or treating his conversation partners as an object of study), he is unable to fully express his theoretical understanding of the Other in his literary works.

In addition to his journalistic endeavors, Kapuściński exerted much effort into furthering his understanding of the theoretical ‘Other.’ Borrowing from various philosophers of ethics Kapuściński constructs his view of the Other as someone who is a “bearer of culture and race,” but at the same time

3 Kapuściński’s The Emperor was published in 1978, The Other was published in 2006, and Travels with Herodotus in 2008.
4 The term ‘unreliable narrator’ is accredited to American literary critique Wayne Booth.
“is a person just like the rest of us” (*The Other* 14). As remarkably simple as this notion may seem, it is quite contrary to the colonial-subaltern relations of many past travel writers, and is not always represented so clearly in Kapuściński’s literary reportages.

With this in mind, Kapuściński argues for empathy, respect, a friendly attitude and (most importantly) communication with Others. Interestingly though, conversation implies and requires the use of such elements: empathy in order to understand what one’s interlocutor means by the statements and gestures they use, respect to allot him or her an appropriate turn in the conversation, and a relaxed, friendly manner to encourage the ease and progress of the dialogue. These elements constitute the building-blocks of conversation and communication, thus when Kapuściński mentions “we should seek dialogue and communication with [the Other]” (*The Other* 92), one can understand this as also including each of the aforementioned components.

Kapuściński recognizes that there is no dialogue with a single voice, and thus in his works he attempts to share the floor with Others, allowing voices other than his own to be heard. Perhaps one of the most clear examples of this can be found in his work *Travels with Herodotus*. In this piece, Kapuściński juxtaposes accounts of his own travels across the globe with excerpts from *The Histories*, a work by the Greek-historian-writer, and traveler, Herodotus. Although Herodotus would also be considered as a European, he is Kapuściński’s Other in time, born in fifth-century BC. The culture from which Herodotus came would undoubtedly differ from Kapuściński’s experiences growing up in the small town of Pińsk, Poland (current Brest Voblast, Belarus). Kapuściński quotes large passages from the historian’s work and attempts to understand how he lived, worked, and collected his information. It is clear that he admires this writer’s techniques: Herodotus’ ability to create a “narration of difference [which]
does not necessarily imply othering” (Guillaume 136). He makes it clear that what he admires about Herodotus is not “accuracy or reliability,” but his “relation to other people.” This is an important element, considering Kapuściński describes reportage as “the form of writing most reliant on the collective” (177). Herodotus certainly understood this idea, incorporating the stories of those he met during his travels, always careful to indicate his sources and give accounts from alternating points of view. Kapuściński underlines this by giving examples such as: “I engaged in a conversation with the priests of the god and asked them...But I saw that their answer does not agree with what the Greeks say...” (181). Herodotus does not favor one culture’s version over the other, but simply makes note of the discrepancies which exist between the two, making sure that stories are heard from all possible voices. He is less concerned with determining a single ‘true’ version, since each version is considered to be true and accurate by those who tell it.

Kapuściński makes use of this technique himself throughout the novel as well. In one instance, he recounts his arrival at Khartoum, saying how the taxi driver “without a word, with no explanation or justification” took him to the wrong hotel. At first, Kapuściński assumes the driver has ignored his request. However, by including a clarification he receives from a Libyan guest that “[i]f a white man arrives in the Sudan, they think he must be an Englishman, and if he is an Englishman, then naturally he must be staying at the Grand” (117), one can understand the reason for this miscommunication, instead of rushing to the premature conclusion that the driver was just rude and did not listen to Kapuściński. He sincerely thought Kapuściński was ill-informed, since he was not from the area, and had given him the incorrect name of the hotel. Yet, such a conclusion can only be reached by telling the event from multiple (and, in this case, cultural) perspectives.
These instances are sporadic though, as Kapuściński shares the majority of Travels with Herodotus with the voice of Herodotus, inserting excerpts from Herodotus’ The Histories throughout the novel. Yet, in The Emperor Kapuściński actually makes use of this technique throughout the majority of the work. He lays out his approach at the beginning of the work, explaining how “[i]n the evenings [he] listened to those who had known the Emperor’s court” (4). He then pieces together their stories, “a collection of monologues of people who survived the revolution [in Ethiopia]” (Horodecka 378), creating a quilt from the accounts of the former courtiers. Kapuściński regrets that “it is only thanks to long-established custom that [he] sign[s] the text with a single name” despite the fact that “dozens of people contribute to producing it” (The Other 13). In this case, there are thirty-four sub-narrators (interviewees) whose stories include numerous others who were involved in the book’s inspiration, and which account for around 75 percent of the text.

This example again shows Kapuściński’s clear attempt to give voice to his Other and to create “the impression of objectivity of the journalist, who separates his point of view from his interlocutors’ perspective” (Horodecka 379). However, although Kapuściński distinguishes his narrative parts with italics, he is still the one who puts their stories to paper. He tells their stories, but in doing so he gives them “the language they could not speak” (Horodecka). While Horodecka refers here to Kapuściński’s use of a form of old Polish language (a form no longer spoken in Poland, let alone by the servants of Haile Selassie) to distinguish and stylize Haile Selassie’s servants, and to express the archaic form by Selassie’s reign, one can also determine another meaning to this statement. The overall narrator of the story, Kapuściński, has the ability to write and publish their stories while they must remain in hiding “trying to survive in [their] own way, according to the possibilities open to [them]” (The Emperor 4). Kapuściński holds a
certain privilege which allows his voice to be heard, so although he is sharing the stories of Others, he is speaking for them as well. He chooses which parts of their interviews will be included and in what language they will be written. In a way, it is as if he is treating them as subalterns, despite Ethiopia’s state of independence. Although he may be giving voice to the Other, he is still reappropriating their tales to fit his own view of the situation. However, Kapuściński makes use of other techniques in an attempt to neutralize this effect.

Kapuściński understands that the nature of each and every Other whom one might encounter is twofold, and that “each one consists of two beings whom it is often difficult to separate” (*The Other* 14). There is the part which is sentient:

he has his joys and sorrows, his good and bad days; he is glad of his successes, does not like to be hungry and does not like it when he is cold; he feels pain as suffering and misery, and good fortune as satisfying and fulfilling.  

and the other part which bears features of one’s associative race, culture, beliefs and convictions. He claims that due to the fluctuating nature of each individual, of each Other, “we never know whom we are going to meet” (15). In his search to discover how one should act when encountering an Other, he concludes that there are three paths one could take: attack, indifference, or communication (which he also defines as war, walls, or dialogue). He states that “man has never stopped wavering between these options; depending on the situation and culture he makes now one, now another choice” (82).

In this way, he paints the Other not as a static, immobile being, unchangeable and set in its ways, but as someone capable of having both

---

5 The original version in Polish uses the neutral pronoun ‘ono’, but has been translated into the masculine singular pronoun in English. This is not a statement by Kapuściński meant to exclude females in his representation of the Other, but merely a result of the complications of translation.
positive and negative attributes in different combinations, at any given time. With this in mind, it would be difficult and foolish for anyone to ever think they could accurately describe a specific culture or Other; even if it were possible, as soon as one had accomplished this, what they were describing would have already changed. By acknowledging the diversity within the Other, Kapuściński seeks to avoid the trap of inversion which is so common in travel writing. As Todorov suggests, many “tend to limit their analysis of the identity/alterity nexus to the figuration of inversion as it simply allows to say that there is only a dichotomized binary whereby the self (a) is the inverted subject of the other (anti-a)” (Todorov qtd. in Guillame 12). Kapuściński recognizes that there is much more to the Other than a simple and static binary, but that the Other, just as the self, is inherently continually changeable, and could be considered “as enemy or as partner at any given moment” (The Other 21).

Kapuściński also shows the presence of this awareness in the writings of Herodotus, who explores “diversity beyond dual and oppositional modes” (Guillaume 145). He does not present alterity as being absolute, but blurs “the boundaries between selves and others” (or in his case, the Greeks with the countries of their periphery). This concept of periphery as opposed to oriental, or “the typical illusion of space – the belief that whatever is far away is different, and the farther away it is, the more different it is” (The Other 16), is also important. Travels with Herodotus includes Others from many places across the globe, spanning from Herodotus’ travels through the Europe, Asia, and Africa of fifth-century BC to Kapuściński’s later travels across the same expanses, as well as South America. There is diversity, yet it is not due wholly to the fact that an Other has lived in a different place than the self, but because of the fluid and adaptable nature which is present in each individual. The distance that the travelers are from their point of departure (the centre from which they began their journeys: Halicarnassus
for Herodotus, and Pińsk for Kapuściński) does not change the degree to which they distinguish a culture or an Other from their own learned cultural practices; they remain consistent in their descriptions regardless of distances. By showing that one can draw the same conclusion from either writer’s travels gives further credence to the idea that difference is not determined by distance.

By refraining from homogenizing Others, Kapuściński does not influence his reader to create sweeping assumptions regarding the people about whom he is writing. Any given event which is described can be taken as an isolated incident or turned into something more significant through its relation to the work as a whole. By including accounts from multiple sources, Kapuściński can show numerous isolated incidents and leave them as just that, but he can also create patterns. However, with the inclusion of diverse positions, even these patterns are shown only as a norm or majority, and not as an absolute truth.

Kapuściński is able to show that “othering is not necessarily the sole mechanism by which collective self-understandings and representations are formed, performed, or transformed” (Guillaume 148). He instead demonstrates that collective understandings and identities can be formed through presentations of common themes among accounts from assorted members of a group, showing that a collective identity can exist without the need for a completely unified and homogenous group which acts as an opposite to another.

In order to further provide a balanced view of the Other, Kapuściński offers both positive and negative examples of the different places and cultures he visits. For example, in describing one of his trips to Ethiopia, Kapuściński tells of Negusi, “the driver with whom [he] traveled about most frequently in Ethiopia” (Travels with Herodotus 184). He describes Negusi’s features using both positive and negative connotative
terms: “skinny neck,” “disproportionately large,” “remarkable,” “eyes of a
dreamy girl.” Initially, it is then difficult to determine what Kapuściński
makes of him; yet as he continues on, he describes Negusi’s abilities to
negotiate through military patrol stops, navigate through dangerous
terrains, and demonstrate his vast knowledge of the region through which
they are travelling. Although Negusi knew “only two expressions in English,”
this did not prevent the two from communicating with one another, even “in
the most fraught circumstances” (185). Kapuściński’s perception of his
Other, Negusi, is shown favourably, and as one of respect. However, during
the same passage he mentions how “soldiers in these parts maraud with
impunity, are spoiled, greedy, and frequently drunk” (185). Kapuściński does
not mention having direct contact with any of these Others, but observes
them through Negusi’s interactions with them. Thus it appears that those
with whom Kapuściński learns to communicate are portrayed in a positive
light, while those who remain silent and uncommunicative (in more than
just words) with Kapuściński are often presented negatively. Perhaps this is
one of the reasons he is so adamant about making sure to establish
communication with Others: he is aware of his own tendencies to generalize
Others with whom he is unable to communicate – those who put up walls, or
between whom he himself builds walls.

Yet this is not only his tendency, as he often notes that the Others
of his Other tell generalized stories about those whom they may never have
actually met or spoken with as well, with some of the cases even referring to
Kapuściński. This is clear when Kapuściński tells of a gathering of rickshaw
drivers in India who heard of his arrival to the hotel. These rickshaw drivers
were of the belief that “[a] sahib [(European)], by definition, must have
money, so they waited patiently, ready to serve” (18, added italics). Yet this
was not the case for Kapuściński, and hence they were surprised when he
refused their offers for a ride. They are presented as not having taken the
diversity of Europeans into account. By setting forth these examples, Kapuściński unveils not only a critique about himself, but also a warning to his readers about the dangers of representing one’s Other as homogenous instead of diverse.

Aside from presenting Others as being capable of multiple judgement views, Kapuściński also displays the hybridity which exists within individuals. The closing line of Travels with Herodotus contains a powerful remark about the hybridity of cultures which individuals display. He describes a moment when he returns to his hotel in Turkey: “When she saw me, she adjusted her facial expression so that the professional smile meant to invite and tempt tourists was tempered by tradition’s injunction always to maintain a serious and indifferent mien toward a strange man” (275). In describing the receptionist’s expression, he reveals how “[t]he girl comes from between two cultures – one, Western, demanding a “professional smile” and another, local and very traditional” (Horodecka 389). This hybridity brings the Other even closer to the self, as the mix of cultures present within each individual is likely to include commonalities between the two. Through this passage, Kapuściński is able to present the diversity within the Other which he described so clearly in his theories: the competing identities which exist simultaneously within an individual.

The theme of diversity amongst the Other is also present in The Emperor. Through this, Kapuściński presents a critique of representations of history which come from only one voice. He presents an alternative to this option: a dialogue – the representation of history from multiple voices, instead of multiple ‘histories’ being expressed through different singular voices (singular, but not unified). In presenting multiple voices within a common work, one can feel the complications and varying dynamics of a situation, instead of being manipulated into the opinion that there is one
true version, which is then either contradicted or discredited by other accounts.

Kapuściński interviews Others who had occupied a myriad of positions within the Emperor's court: from clerks to door openers, and from protocol officials to someone whose job it was “to walk among the dignitaries and wipe the urine from their shoes with a satin cloth” after the Emperor’s dog had relieved himself on them (5). Kapuściński did not discriminate. Yet, not only is there diversity among the jobs which his interviewees held, but there is also the inclusion of accounts from people of differing political opinions (again, exhibiting the heterogeneous nature of any group). There is a diversity which exists even among individuals of a shared culture.

Regardless of one’s position (political, socioeconomic, etc.), each individual referred to the Emperor with an expression of respect: “Most praiseworthy Highness,” “His Indefatigable Majesty,” “His Most Exalted Majesty,” etc. However, even within this cultural tradition there was diversity; some individuals were careful to use exuberant adjectives to describe the degree of the Emperor’s ‘highness,’ or ‘majesty,’ while others would simply (and consistently) stay with the base expressions “His Highness” or “His Majesty.” While it seems possible that this diversity could be an indication of one’s political views or class, further clues are not apparent in all cases.

Kapuściński is careful, though, to illustrate the diverse feelings which exist amongst his Other towards the monarchical system. In one account, T. K.-B. (as identified by Kapuściński) explains the scene at the Emperor's daily arrival to the Old Palace by describing the “crowd of subjects [who] waited” as well as the members of the court who “all gathered early so as not to miss the Emperor’s arrival,” since “[e]veryone wanted very badly to be noticed by the Emperor” (13-14). T. K.-B. describes
these people as being so enamoured with the Emperor, and driven by their desire to be noticed by him that they would “squeeze,” “worm,” “push,” and “jostle” in order to position themselves into such a position that the Emperor might notice them. However, such feelings of loyalty and devotion to the Emperor are not expressed by all members. Contrarily, M. tells of people “brawling, rebelling, bashing in the skulls of tax collectors, hanging policemen, running dignitaries out of town” and how the students are “praising them” (96-97). By showing alternating accounts of the events which took place, Kapuściński does not present his Other as merely an inversion of himself or his own culture, but as a complex being—or moreover, a collection of complex beings—worthy of presenting its own voices. He is cautious not to present his Other merely as a dichotomy of ‘self’ and ‘Other’ or ‘us’ and ‘them’, but as fluid and diverse.

In fact, in certain cases he presents conflicting remarks or ideals which come from the same individual. For instance, although P. H.-T. shows his admiration for the Emperor by listing a number of “the breakthroughs that His Distinguished Highness made,” he does not agree with all of the Emperor’s decisions, stating that “[u]nfortunately, driven by the desire for progress, His August Majesty committed a certain imprudence” (52). It is clear that P. H.-T. is opposed to one of the Emperor’s decisions, but he does not state that it was an error, or a mistake. The conflict between his reverence for the Emperor and his critique of the Emperor’s decisions are clear in this statement; he is unable to outright say that he feels the Emperor has faulted and continues to speak highly of the Emperor (with flourishing adjectives), yet at the same time he still makes it clear that he objects to some of the things the Emperor has done. Kapuściński includes this interviewees conflicting statements not to discredit the account, but to further accentuate the internal conflicts and contradictions which exist in each being.
Yet, in spite of Kapuściński’s efforts to utilize techniques which exhibit the diversity present in the Other, he falls prey to the trend of presenting dichotomies, or making “sweeping generalisations,” as some scholars critique (Waldstein 495). His efforts to present the Other as diverse are clear, but his writing does not reflect this one hundred percent of the time. Kapuściński still provides instances where he makes generalizing statements, such as “The Ethiopians are deeply distrustful” (4). In doing so, he homogenizes all the people belonging to a particular nation, instead of avoiding such an implication through the use quantifying adjectives such as “some” or even “many.” By neglecting to use such tools, he detracts from the full value of his attempts to give a fair representation of the Other.

In order not to overpower the Other voices which Kapuściński includes in his works, he does not set himself up as a position of ultimate authority, but instead uses techniques of a unreliable narrator. He supplies just enough doubt about his own expertise on matters for his readers to question his accuracy. This is not to have readers mistrust the statements that he makes, yet by setting himself up in this role he presents the idea that although he is the author of these works, his accounts of an experience are no more valuable than the Other voices he includes throughout his works.

Kapuściński acknowledges the fact that in the eyes of his Other, he is an Other too. He recounts: “[a]s I walk through a village in the mountains of Ethiopia, a gang of children runs after me, pointing at me in amusement and shouting: ‘Faranji! Faranji!’ That means ‘foreigner’, ‘other’, because to them I am an Other” (The Other 86). The occupation of this status of Other signifies that whatever Kapuściński says about an Other, must therefore apply to himself as well. Yet it is not only what Kapuściński says about the Other which is implied, but also any conceptions about ‘the Other’ which the readers themselves may hold, for example, an Other as strange, or an Other as unaware of cultural behaviors and practices which differ from its own.
Kapuściński allows himself to constantly question “Who will this new Other be? What will our encounter be like? What shall we say to each other? And in what language? Will we be able to listen to each other? Understand each other?” (92), encouraging his reader to do the same. Kapuściński is careful to outline the uncertainty which comes from each encounter with an Other. His theoretical voice advocates an unassuming stance; he does not presuppose to know what will happen in an encounter with an Other, and has no intention of trying to dictate what should or will transpire.

Kapuściński does not pretend to know that to which he is ignorant, but acknowledges his ignorance in order to provide a point of departure from which to learn about the various events, surroundings, and people he encounters during his travels. In *Travels with Herodotus*, he describes the moment he is first told that he will be sent abroad to India. “I knew nothing about India. I feverishly searched my thoughts for some associations, images, names. Nothing. Zero” (10). Since he makes his reader aware of this, he cannot bluff, but instead writes openly of his experiences from his limited perspective, noting the gaps in his knowledge and highlighting that which is unfamiliar to him. “A woman sells something wrapped in green leaves—what is it? What do those leaves enfold?” (19). Kapuściński cannot be certain, and so he does not presume to know.

He uses stories and explanations from Others in an attempt to fill these voids of knowledge. However, he shows that even when he feels he has an understanding of what makes himself Other to Others, he is not able to fully grasp all of the elements which define a particular culture from another. On his first voyage outside of Poland—a stop in the West, (Italy)—he meets another journalist, named Mario. After offering Kapuściński a place to stay, Mario and his wife take him shopping, because as Kapuściński explains, “[t]he confrontation between East and West took place not only in
the military realm,” but in other areas, such as fashion, as well. Although Kapuściński thinks that with Mario’s help he has identified what distinguishes his Eastern (Polish) culture from the Western culture of the Italians, and thus with his new Italian suit he will fit in, he grows conscious that this is not the case.

I sense that they took me for an alien, and although I should have been happy, sitting there beneath the miraculous skies of Rome, I began to feel unpleasant and uncomfortable. I had changed my suit, but I apparently could not conceal whatever lay beneath it that had shaped and marked me as a foreign particle. (14)

He emphasizes to his reader that even with the knowledge he acquires during his travels, he will never be able to present the entire picture of an experience, culture, or society, and for this reason he continues to advocate for continuous communication and dialogue between Others; perhaps maybe not to ever obtain the full picture, but at least one that is as complete as possible.

However, he does not stop there. Kapuściński does not only stress the fact that his accounts are incomplete, but that at times they are misguided. In describing an encounter he has with a couple of gendarme in Congo, he begins by chronicling “all manner of villainy, brutishness, and bestiality” which have been committed by Congolese military police, further stating that “[a]n encounter with any one of them could be deadly” (164). He carries this perception with him as they approach, saying how he felt as if “[t]he men walking toward [him] were not ordinary people to be casually encountered, but dehumanized creatures, extraterrestrials. A new species” (165). His anxieties towards these Others causes him to drip with sweat. Yet, although he initially gives these two men such a negative label--unhuman even--the reality of this encounter turns out only to be that one of the officers wished to inquire, in a tone which Kapuściński interprets as
“humble, even pleading,” “Monsieur, avez-vous une cigarette, s’il vous plaît?” (166). The politeness and gentry of this man’s request for a cigarette lies in strong contradiction to Kapuściński’s initial description. The formality of the sentence structure, the address of politesse, and the additional tag of ‘s’il vous plaît’ all indicate a high level of civility and humility, as opposed to the “brutishness” or “bestiality” which Kapuściński had claimed to be characteristic of these individuals. He does this intentionally, to show his reader that his observations and conclusions are not always accurate; he is human, prone to making judgments about Others, and also prone to err. While this does not suggest that one should presume he is telling lies, Kapuściński makes it clear that he only ever has a limited perspective of a situation, one which he tries to minimize by including the voices and opinions of Others, but which is still present nonetheless.

Even Kapuściński’s narrative passages throughout The Emperor are riddled with influence from Others. He shows that he is trying to fill the gaps in his knowledge with accounts from Others by including statements such as “He tells me...,” “He goes on to say...,” “The one I am talking to ponders...,” “He thinks...” (64, 84, 132). By doing this, Kapuściński indicates that his words alone are not enough, but also that he himself is not in a position of authority to determine the accuracy of his interviewees’ accounts. Just as he does not claim to have more information than he can actually prove, he does not claim to know whether his interlocutor’s stories are truthful, but simply presents that which is told to him and which he finds to be worthy of representing.

There are accounts, though, which provide supporting evidence towards their validity. Kapuściński remarks how after sitting beside a window, he is told “Somewhere else, sir, please” (5). He then goes on to describe the unrest in the city, and how his foreign presence in someone’s home (which would be easily detectable if he sits in such a visible location as
beside a window) would attract unwanted and possibly dangerous attention. Although he was aware of the tense situation in the city, even noting that he was “afraid of getting caught along with [its] inhabitants,” he was ignorant to the situation’s implications that he should not be sitting beside a window. In light of the situation, it seems very logical to avoid sitting beside a window, yet Kapuściński is not used to having to be so cautious, and thus appears naïve as to how he should respond in such a situation. His Other, who cautions him away from the window, is presented as the knowledgeable authority on how to act in these manners, and not Kapuściński. In this way, Kapuściński suggests that he is not the most knowledgeable or authoritative character from whom the reader should derive all of his or her information. Kapuściński places himself in a position of naïveté, so that his voice is not given a dominant and authoritative position over the Other voices which are included in his works, but is simply one in the tapestry, complimentary to all of the rest. He illustrates the knowledge of Others, knowledge which he himself lacks, demonstrating just how valuable their voices are; they provide insight which Kapuściński himself is not always able to give, often due to the impairment of his Eurocentric upbringing.

An additional technique used by Kapuściński to place himself in the role of ‘naïve narrator’ is to create questions out of statements. “Left alone, he, an old man with one foot in the grave, won’t be a danger to them, will he? And so he wants to stay? To save himself?” (142). Kapuściński uses this technique quite often, posing questions instead of making direct statements. Even though he often implicates that he holds a particular opinion about a matter, by posing it as a question (or series of questions) he neither treats it, nor allows it to be treated, as a complete and unarguable fact. With this technique, he emphasizes his lingering uncertainties and lack of authority on the matter about which he writes.
Although presenting a state of habitual naïveté seems to equate (and in some cases, even diminish) the value given to Kapuściński’s accounts compared with those of his Other, this technique also draws attention to the barriers which exist between Kapuściński and his Others. It places him behind a wall by exhibiting that he is unable to ever completely understand the Other and its customs.

Kapuściński admits that he has difficulties learning and remembering that for which he does not already have some prior knowledge. “I had seen only that which I was able to name: for example, I remembered the acacia tree, but not the tree standing next to it, whose name I did not know” (*Herodotus* 22). He claims that without knowledge of an area’s local language, “this universe will remain impenetrable and unknowable” (22). Kapuściński acknowledges the impossibility of such a task (to understand all the mysteries and intricacies of an Other’s culture), and by doing so he accepts the fact that he will remain naïve. Unfortunately, with the acceptance of his state of unawareness, he finds himself, at times, hiding behind his wall of ignorance and unable to perform the dialogue for which he so strongly advocates. The only hope in such a matter is that although Kapuściński may sometimes find himself building up walls between himself and Others, he acknowledges that, just like his Other, his nature is fluid and constantly changing, thus despite finding himself behind a wall in one instance, he can move to dialogue in the next. Afterall, he reminds his reader that "[d]oors and gates are not just to shut ourselves away from Others, but can also be opened to the Other, to invite them in as guests" (*The Other* 84).

Kapuściński’s representation of the Other is optimistic. He recognizes himself in the Other, and the Other within himself, allowing him the base from which to build his presentation of the Other as a subject, a partner in dialogue, rather than an object of study. Is Kapuściński’s
representation foolproof? No. Does the communication contain breakdowns? Certainly, but there is a constant effort to reinstate, re-initiate and continue the dialogue.

Kapuściński is not always successful in remaining objective, and does fall into the writer's temptation of using hyperbole to sensationalize a text to thus hold a reader's interest; but by maintaining a dialogue, Kapuściński also provides us with alternative voices which may contradict, expand, and cause one to question Kapuściński's own voice. Similarly, by placing himself in the position of an unreliable narrator, Kapuściński does not attempt to present himself as a point of (absolute) authority on the events and people about which and whom he speaks, but simply as an individual presenting one account of a particular experience. His voice is one among many, no more or less different than any of the others; in this way, he is just the same as an Other, because he shares the same difference between himself and an Other as the Other shares with him.

Looking at the individual statements made in Kapuściński's work is not enough to determine how he seeks to represent Others; his works must be examined in their entirety, their full form, in order to fully understand how Kapuściński views and wishes to represent the Other. Kapuściński creates a complex picture of human beings, and not simply of 'the Other.' He shows both himself and Others to be fluid, slipping between different choices from one encounter to the next. Rather than condemning Kapuściński for his shortcomings in creating a constant dialogue (his tendency to hide behind walls through certain descriptive techniques), or simply praising his inspiring instances of dialogue, one should accept the overall complexity and variety Kapuściński shows within himself just as he describes the Other, and recognize the Kapuściński within one's self, as simultaneously the Other and the Same.
Works Cited


INFORMATION

MAÎTRISE ÈS ARTS EN LITTÉRATURES ET CULTURES DU MONDE

LITERATURES AND CULTURES MASTERS PROGRAM

La Maîtrise ès arts en littératures et cultures du monde est la première au Canada et unique en son genre.

This one-year MA brings together areas of study such as literature, film, media, sociolinguistics, gender, diasporas and minorities. The program explores the comparative and interdisciplinary nature of world cultures and arts, both past and present. La Maîtrise fait appel à l’expertise combinée des professeurs du Département des langues et littératures modernes et d’autres départements à la Faculté des arts et la Faculté des sciences sociales.

Discover how identities are shaped by cultural expressions in a national and transnational context. Explorez la nature de la représentation et de la diversité culturelle. Élargissez votre savoir interculturel dans le milieu dynamique de la capitale nationale.

Pour plus d’informations visitez / For more information see: http://arts.uottawa.ca/languesmodernes/programmes-d-etudes. Ou contactez / Or contact: lcm@uottawa.ca
Confetti est un journal créé par les étudiants de la maîtrise ès arts en littératures et cultures du monde / Confetti is a journal created by the students of World Literatures and Cultures Masters’ Program.

Conception de la couverture / Front Cover Design © Julie Mongeon
Image de l’arrière plan de / Background image: www.free-picture.net